

**#NotATarget**



# Attacks on health personnel and infrastructures

48<sup>th</sup> Middle East Medical Assembly  
First Global Conflict Medicine Congress

Sebastian Spencer MD MSc CEDE  
Medical Director MSF-OCB

Françoise Bouchet-Saulnier  
MSF-International Legal Director





8.132.100



594.900



219.300



83.500



440



# MSF Trauma hospital – Kunduz

## September 2015





# MSF Trauma hospital – Kunduz

## October 2015



## MSF TRAUMA HOSPITAL KUNDUZ, AFGHANISTAN

#INDEPENDENTINVESTIGATION  
CHANGE.ORG/EVENWARHASRULES

BEFORE

21 June 2015



MSF TRAUMA CENTRE  
36°43'4.91"N 68°51'43.96"E

MSF OFFICE  
36°43'3.29"N 68°51'42.62"E

AFTER

8 October 2015



— MSF compound





3 October 2015 Kunduz Afghanistan

42 people killed

*24 Patients*

*14 MSF staff*

*4 Caretakers*

No more trauma care for the population



# Why ?

- No protection or consideration for civilians
- No respect of the “No Strike List”
- No warning
- No application of the principle of precaution & proportionality under the International Humanitarian Law



# What to do after?

- Supporting the victims and the families
- Request an independent investigation
- Humanitarian MoU with all actors of violence
  - Identification
  - Location
  - Communication
  - Key contacts
  - Warning mechanisms
- Get support to continue the work





# MSF request for independent investigation of attacks

- Following the attack on **Kunduz** in the “fog of war”:
  - MSF asks for investigation by the International Humanitarian Fact-Finding Commission
  - MSF engages in an in-depth internal review of the incident
  - MSF refuses the mistake explanation and requests access to the results of the internal US investigation
  - 721 out of 3000 pages released



# MSF incidents and context

- From collateral damage to mistake
- Accusation of sheltering terrorists
- 82 MSF or MSF supported facilities attacked in 2015-16
- **Kunduz, Afghanistan**: October 3rd, 2015
- **Yemen**, 4 major attacks on MSF hospitals by the Saudi-led international military coalition
- **Syria**: attacks on hospitals = major pattern in the conduct of hostilities by the government and international military coalition



# Attacks on MSF facilities: *the figures*

## Afghanistan:

- 3 October 2015, *Kunduz*  
42 killed and over 30 injured

## Yemen:

- 27 October 2015, *Haydan*, 2 injured
- 3 December 2015, *Taiz*, 9 injured
- 10 January 2016, *Razeh*, 6 killed, 8 injured
- 15 August 2016, *Abs*, 19 killed and 24 injured



# International Humanitarian Law

## Protecting Medical Mission

- **1864** first Geneva Convention (GC)
- **1949** Geneva Conventions (I,II,III, IV): protection of wounded and sick (civilians and combatants “out of combat”)
- **1977** Additional Protocols I and II, global protection of medical services in international and non international armed conflicts (IAC, NIAC)
- **2005** International Humanitarian Customary Rules (IAC, NIAC)







# Is this a new norm?

- **One common outcome:** staff, patients, caretakers killed or injured; facilities stop functioning; civilians deprived of care.
- Perpetrators include **members of the United Nations Security Council** or allies of the UNSC or forces trained by UNSC members.





# How to react?

- Investigation of each incident
- Reaffirmation and clarification of the rules



# UNITED STATES CENTRAL COMMAND **#NotATarget** October 2015

SUBJECT: *Summary of the Airstrike on the MSF Trauma Center in Kunduz, Afghanistan on October 3, 2015; Investigation and Follow-on Actions*

Available at: <https://publicintelligence.net/centcom-kunduz-hospital-attack/>

“The comprehensive investigation concluded that this tragic incident was caused by a combination of human errors, compounded by communication and equipment failures. Fatigue and high operational tempo also contributed to the incident. These factors contributed to “the fog of war” which is the uncertainty often encountered during combat operations.”





# #NotATarget

