ETHOS

Tensions between institutionalised political justice and experienced (mis)recognition: Portuguese case study on the experiences of Roma communities

Sara Araújo and Laura Brito

This Working Paper was written within the framework of Work Package 5 (justice as lived experience) for deliverable 5.2 (comparative report on the tensions between institutionalized political justice and experienced (mis)recognition)

July 2018

Acknowledgements

We would like to express our most sincere gratitude to the activists who accepted to be part of this study, sharing with us their insights, opinions and knowledge. Their support was essential to accomplish this report. We are truly convinced that solutions for Europe must be designed through horizontal dialogues between different actors committed to making justice a reality in law and in practice.

ETHOS

Want to learn more about what we are working on?

Visit us at:

Website: https://ethos-europe.eu

Facebook: www.facebook.com/ethosjustice/

Blog: www.ethosjustice.wordpress.com

Twitter: www.twitter.com/ethosjustice

Hashtag: #ETHOSjustice

Youtube: www.youtube.com/ethosjustice

European Landscapes of Justice (web) app: http://myjustice.eu/

About ETHOS

ETHOS - Towards a European THeory Of juStice and fairness is a European Commission Horizon 2020 research project that seeks to provide building blocks for the development of an empirically informed European theory of justice and fairness. The project seeks to do so by:

a) refining and deepening knowledge on the European foundations of justice - both historically based and contemporarily envisaged;
b) enhancing awareness of mechanisms that impede the realisation of justice ideals as they are lived in contemporary Europe;
c) advancing the understanding of the process of drawing and re-drawing of the boundaries of justice (fault lines); and
d) providing guidance to politicians, policy makers, advocacies and other stakeholders on how to design and implement policies to reverse inequalities and prevent injustice.

ETHOS does not merely understand justice as an abstract moral ideal that is universal and worth striving for. Rather, justice is understood as a re-enacted and re-constructed lived experience. The experience is embedded in firm legal, political, moral, social, economic and cultural institutions that are geared to giving members of society what is their due.

In the ETHOS project, justice is studied as an interdependent relationship between the ideal of justice and its real manifestation – as set in the highly complex institutions of modern European societies. The relationship between the normative and practical, the formal and informal, is acknowledged and critically assessed through a multi-disciplinary approach.

To enhance the formulation of an empirically-based theory of justice and fairness, ETHOS will explore the normative (ideal) underpinnings of justice and their practical realisation in four heuristically defined domains of justice - social justice, economic justice, political justice, and civil and symbolic justice. These domains are revealed in several spheres:

a) philosophical and political tradition,
b) legal framework,
c) daily (bureaucratic) practice,
d) current public debates, and
e) the accounts of vulnerable populations in six European countries (the Netherlands, the UK, Hungary, Austria, Portugal and Turkey).

The question of drawing boundaries and redrawing the fault-lines of justice permeates the entire investigation.

Alongside Utrecht University in the Netherlands who coordinates the project, five further research institutions cooperate. They are based in Austria (European Training and Research Centre for Human Rights and Democracy), Hungary (Central European University), Portugal (Centre for Social Studies), Turkey (Boğaziçi University), and the UK (University of Bristol). The research project lasts from January 2017 to December 2019.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This deliverable contributes to a study on justice as political representation in the European context that is based on national case studies of Roma (D5.2). This is the Portuguese Roma case study.

The 1974 Portuguese revolution – the Carnation Revolution - brought democracy with free speech, democratic elections and democratic institutions. What this study globally questions is: democracy for whom? Focusing on Roma communities' experiences and perceptions, we try to understand if everyone is equally represented by democratic institutions. The method is based on desk research and semi-structured interviews with key informants. Desk research involved an academic literature review but also an analysis of policy documents and legislation. We tried as much as possible to follow what Roma activists are discussing on social media both among themselves and with the general public, examining what kind of concerns and claims they have, how they express themselves, what kinds of solutions they present and how far their voices are heard.

Portugal does not monitor ethnicity in the census and there are no credible data on the current number of Roma living in Portugal, their geographical location and lifestyle - information considered crucial for the design of appropriate interventions. Data on Roma communities are collected unofficially without being made public. This policy has been criticized by activists who argue this situation creates an obstacle to proving the presence and impact of structural racism and to designing proper policies against it. Researchers on racism in Portugal argue that policies that promote so-called active inclusion and the empowerment initiatives are implemented as a civilizing and disciplinary programme. Self-proclaimed anti-racist measures may ephemerally celebrate Roma culture, but they ultimately work as explanations for their uncivilized, non-modern circumstances and for the assumed need for surveillance of their status as beneficiaries (e.g. of the Social Insertion Income).

Roma communities are not expected to speak for themselves but to be explained by the owners of knowledge and power. Other people produce policy documents to address their problems. Goodwill is often paternalist and does not change the big picture of a racist and colonial world were some groups are allowed to stay but are not considered part of it. Integration tends to signify assimilation or tolerance and never real recognition. This blocks the possibilities of Roma and other minorities to define racism in their own terms and produce awareness of structural racism. In this context solutions and politics are mainly cosmetic. Roma are often invited by institutions and associations to show the inclusiveness and interculturality of their work. However, frequently they are expected to be an ornament and have no power to define anything important. In the same way research about Roma reproduces their invisibility and erases their voices.

We propose to do research "with" Roma and design politicies "with" Roma instead of research "about" and policies "about". In science and in politics we must test and use devices and methodologies that are more inclusive, open to different voices where minorities can speak for themselves and be heard. We propose conducting a workshop of the Popular University of Social Movements (UPMS) in Portugal. The UPMS is not a conventional popular university but a device that combines knowledge born from social struggles and knowledge emerging from committed academic work. Coming to existence in 2003 in the context of the World Social Forum, it is a collective asset based on three central concepts of the Epistemologies of the South: ecology of knowledges, reciprocal learning and intercultural translation. The starting point of UPMS is the recognition of mutual ignorance and its end point is the shared production of innovative knowledge. It is led into operation by holding workshops preferably lasting two days, which run on a residential basis in which discussion periods alternate with time dedicated to study and reflection, and leisure activities.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Abbreviations

- ACIDI – High Commission for Immigration and Intercultural Dialogue [*Alto Comissariado para a Imigração e Diálogo Intercultural*]
- ACIME – Hight Commission for Immigration and Ethnic Minorities [*Alto Comissariado para a Imigração e Minorias Étnicas*]
- ACM – High Commission for Migration [*Alto Comissariado para a Migração*]
- CESIS – Center for Social Intervention Studies [*Centro de Estudos para a Intervenção Social*]
- CRP – Portuguese Republic Constitution [*Constituição da República Portuguesa*]
- DGEEC – General Directorate of Education and Science Statistics [*Direção Geral de Estatísticas da Educação e Ciência*]
- ERRC – European Roma Rights Centre
- FCPNM – Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities
- FRA – European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights
- FSG – Fundácion Secretariado Gitano
- GACI – Roma Communities Support Agency [*Gabinete de Apoio às Comunidades Ciganas*]
- NAP - – National Action Program
- PALOP – Portuguese-speaking African Countries [*PALOP – Países Africanos de Língua Oficial Portuguesa*]
- PpDM – Portuguese Platorm for Women Rights [*Plataforma Portuguesa para os Direitos das Mulheres*]
- SII – Social Insertion Income [*RSI- Rendimento Social Único*]
- SME – Social Market Employment
- SRP – Special Relocation Program

Introduction

The ETHOS project's global aim is to theoretically and empirically explore the fault lines of justice and to formulate a theory of justice and fairness that combines theoretical, legal and empirical analysis. Some questions were formulated to drive the multiple analysis and case studies: What is just and what is unjust? Where does (in)justice starts? Who is entitled to (what kind of) justice? On what grounds? Who should secure justice and how? WP5 examines the subjective experiences of those vulnerable to injustice in three spheres of justice: political, economic and social. This deliverable is part of a comparative study on justice as political representation in the European context that is based on national case studies of Roma (D5.2). This is the the Portuguese case study.

The 25th of April 1974 was a turning point for the majority of Portuguese society. Known as the day of the Carnation Revolution it put an end to more than four decades of dictatorship. The 1976 Constitution established fundamental rights that for a big part of the population were taken for granted at least until the crisis and the austerity response came to question many certainties: right to education, to work, to health and to housing. The revolution brought democracy with free speech, democratic elections and democratic institutions. What this study globally questions is: democracy for whom? More specifically, and focusing on Roma communities' experiences and perceptions, we want to understand if everyone is equally represented by democratic institutions. Are all voices equally heard in Portuguese democracy?

The logic of inequality pervades national societies. There are different forms and intensities of exclusion inside each country. Boaventura de Sousa Santos argues that civil society is composed of three circles: intimate civil society, strange civil society, and uncivil civil society. The intimate civil society is a sphere of hyper-inclusion, i.e. citizens who have connections with the power of the State, who enjoy all their rights and have access to public resources far beyond what the policy of rights would guarantee them. The strange civil society consists of citizens who are moderately integrated, who can exercise their civic and political rights more or less freely, who have but little access to social, economic and cultural rights. Lastly, the uncivil civil society is the outer circle, a lawless territory, where appropriation and violence rule. It is composed of the citizens who are excluded from the social contract, living in invisible areas (Santos, 2003: 25-26). In this report we will focus on the barriers Portuguese Roma face to have their voices heard and feel politically represented.

The Roma have been in Portugal for 500 years. The Kalé group arrived in the Iberian Peninsula in the first quarter of the 15th century and in Portugal in the middle of the same century. The discrimination and marginalization they were subjected to since the beginning forced them to a great isolation. The barrier created, on the one hand, allowed them to preserve their identity and culture, and on the other, led to the forgetfulness, the distrust of majority society and their own exclusion. For centuries they were persecuted and subjected to repressive laws that legitimized very harsh punishments, not always proportional to the crimes committed. Only almost four centuries after its entry into Portugal, the Constitution of 1822 attributes Portuguese citizenship to the Roma (ACIDI, 2013: 9, 10).

As recognized in the comparative report the term 'Roma' has no universal character: "For some, it is a move away from pejorative stereotypes summoned by words like 'ciganos', 'cigany' and 'Gypsy', for others it is a term imposed from above that has little daily resonance". For the purposes of this report, coordinators have chosen to generally use the term 'Roma' and we follow this decision. In Portugal, the word Roma only very recently started to be heard. As we can read in a recent study "The Portuguese Ciganos [corresponding to the English 'Gypsies'] do not self-identify with the word 'Roma' or 'Roms', but with the term 'Ciganos', with the exception of some mediators, association leaders and people with average and higher education, activists and members of Roma movement, who know this designation" (Mendes, Magano and Candeias, 2016: 6). Through the report we

use the term 'Gypsy' every time we are transcribing a speech which uses the equivalent Portuguese word 'cigano'.

Methodology for this case study we followed the guidelines designed by coordinators which included desk research and semi-structured interviews with key informants. Desk research involved academic literature review but not only. We analysed policy documents and legislation and tried as much as possible to follow what Roma activists are discussing on social networks among themselves and with the larger public, what kinds of concerns and claims they have, how they express themselves, what kinds of solutions they present and how far their voices can be heard. In this process we learned not only about Roma's specific condition but also about the limits of our democracy.

Considering interviews, we had to find a balance between the ambition of the case study and the time frame of the deliverable. In that sense we opted for a small number of interviews. We did not seek a representative sample of the Roma but key informants with different experiences. In that sense we contacted activists from different Portuguese cities, male and female, with different ages, experiences and profiles of public intervention: Interview 1, Porto, independent activist, early forties, 2 February 2018; Interview 2, Figueira da Foz, male, Portuguese delegate Romed Programme, early forties, 12 March 2018; Interview 3, Lisboa, Olga Mariano, Roma activist, President of AMUCIP and Letras Nómadas, late sixties, 12 March 2018; Interview 4, Figueira da Foz, twenties, 15 March 2018; Interview 5, Espinho, winner of the prize "Gypsy Women of the Year", colaborated with several organizations, thirties, 16 March 2018.

The small number of interviews was related not only to lack of time but also to a discomfort that was felt since the beginning of the field research. The initial idea was to invite activists to our research centre to make a speech. We wanted their voices to be heard and use a collective process for the writing of the report. However, the imperatives of multiple deadlines were not compatible with this initial idea. The difficulties experienced to schedule some interviews might be partially explained by the resistance of Roma to have their knowledge and speech appropriated to be translated into other people's knowledge and language. As argued by the Epistemologies of the South proposal, modern social sciences produce outputs by transforming popular knowledges into raw materials for the production of science (Santos, 2014). This idea of an extractive social science is addressed in the last part of this report and in the conclusion and was amazingly expressed by Olga Mariano, Roma activist, in interview:

> I think it's important, when you have these kind of projects, to invite Gypsy institutions as partners. I'm frank, I am a very blunt person, what I'm saying isn't politically correct, but if it's about Gypsy it is with Gypsy! [...]. If it is about the Gypsy community, it is with the Gypsy community, not for the Gypsy community. If I am committed to giving my testimony as a Gypsy woman, I Olga Mariana, I'll be committed in double. In this case, I'm always in a rush [...] Our main goal is to minimize the social gap between Gypsy and non-Gypsy. We don't want assimilation, we want the sharing, coming together. We can give really good things.

Doing research *with* by opposition to doing research *about* configures a paradigmatic transition being discussed by academics that involves the recognition of the coloniality of scientific knowledge (Castro-Gómez, 2007; Mignolo, 2003), the acknowledgment of the limits of science and a process of "ecology of knowledges", i.e, knowing through horizontal dialogues between academic and popular knowledge (Santos, 2014). Though there is a long process to democratize and decolonize academic institutions, reflexivity about the limits of our research tools and frameworks is crucial. In this study on representation this reflexivity is particularly relevant.

The report is divided into four main parts. The first part presents a very brief and selective country profile. It starts with the history of Portugal as a colonial and semi-peripheral country and approaches the raising of the myth of Lusotropicalism. This discussion is followed by the description of the changing patterns of migration, showing how Portugal changed from a mass emigration country to a country receiving a considerable number of immigrants. This first part ends with the discussion of the fabricated illusion of Portugal as a non-racist country.

The second part is sustained mainly on academic literature review and discusses different issues in relation to the Portuguese Roma communities, namely education, employment and social benefits, housing and health. In the third part, we focus on the state intervention, describing and briefly analysing programmes and policies concerning the Roma. In the last part we present the voices of Roma, ie how Roma experience Portuguese democracy and how they evaluate the way they are represented. This last part focuses mainly on a transversal critique about how Roma are made invisible by institutions and other citizens.

PART I THE PORTUGUESE CONTEXT

1. THE OLD SEMI-PERIPHERAL COUNTRY AND THE MYTH OF LUSOTROPICALISM

Portugal's independence goes back to the 12th century (in 1139 the Portuguese monarchy adopted the title 'King of Portugal' and in 1143 the title was recognized by the neighbouring kingdom and the Holy See). It is stated in official reports that "Portugal is one of the oldest European states" and "Portuguese borders were basically traced in the 13th century, and are probably the oldest borders of Europe" (Council of Europe, 2004).

In the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, Portugal played a decisive role in European expansion. However, this pioneering capacity was never translated into the occupation of a central position in the world system. Portugal was at the helm of European's military and commercial expansion of North Africa, the nautical link between the Atlantic and the Indian Oceans and the European discovery of Brazil. As a result, the country came to establish a vast colonial empire that included territories in Africa, Asia and South America. Nonetheless, it never fully assumed the characteristics of the modern State of central countries, being the only colonising country to be considered native or wild by other colonising countries. It was central to its colonies but remained on the European periphery (Santos, 2012).

In the second half of the 1920s begins one of the longest European dictatorships, designated after 1933 as *Estado Novo* (New State). Regardless of the decolonisation processes taking place in Europe and the wear and tear resulting from the colonial war (liberation struggles from the point of view of colonies) starting in the 1960s, Portugal remains clinging to its imperial past. From the 1950s onwards, under the "proudly alone" maxim (*orgulhosamente sós*), and invoking a soft coloniser condition ideologically supported by Lusotropicalism theories, Portugal promoted its isolation and the maintenance of a colonial empire when times were of change.

Lusotropicalism is a distorted view of the Portuguese colonisation developed by the Brazilian Gilberto Freire from the 1930s onwards, which invoked the specificity of Portuguese colonialism, describing it as harmonious and mild. According to these ideas, Portugal was in Africa to form a Luso-tropical and multiracial community, in which blacks and whites would live happily together. The Portuguese were allegedly non-racist and prone to miscegenation. Freire's ideas were initially ignored but were appropriated by fascist propaganda during the 1950s. To legitimise Portuguese politics at a time when colonialism was internationally frowned upon, it was not enough to speak of historical rights, it was necessary to deny colonial violence: according to the discourses, "the Portuguese did not exploit, rather 'integrated' into the tropics; did not violate, rather 'created worlds', their relations with the natives were lavished with 'affectivity', etc." (Neto, 1997: 348). As Conceição Neto states, "the colonial discourse was so insistent in academic circles, in the press, in literature, in school textbooks, in the adulteration of history, in common places, that still today it is projected in the statements of many former colonisers" (idem: 327, 328).

In the 1970s, Portugal was the least developed country in Europe and, at the same time, the holder of the largest and most enduring empire. The 1960s and 1970s were marked by a wave of Portuguese emigration to central European countries, such as France, Germany and Luxembourg. A population with very low levels of education

sought developing countries to improve their living conditions. During this period, many crossed the countries' borders to escape what on the Portuguese side was the Colonial War and what on the colonies' angle were the Wars of National Liberation.

The 1970s marked the end of the dictatorship and the replacement of the imperial project of colonial expansion with a democratic project of European integration. The Carnation Revolution (*Revolução dos Cravos*), on April 25, 1974, introduced a cycle marked by the end of the colonial empire; a brief attempt of state socialism, followed by the building of a parliamentary democracy; and by the entry into the European Union in 1986. The project of colonial expansion functioned, during the years of European rejection, as an imaginary that allowed Portugal to dispense with Europe. The project of European integration worked, during the moment of acceptance, as an imaginary that allowed Portugal to dispense relations with the former colonies. Along the way, Portugal constructed a Eurocentric narrative of its relationship with the former colonies, based on a conception of linear time, representing Africa as a backward continent, a configuration of failed states, from whom Europe has nothing to learn (Santos, 2012).

2. FROM A COUNTRY OF EMIGRATION TO A COUNTRY OF IMMIGRATION

Portugal is traditionally a country of emigrants. Massive immigration is a new phenomenon for the country to deal with. Emigration might be identified in the 15th century with overseas exploration. During 20th and 21st centuries the emigration profile assumed specific shapes and privileged different destinies in different moments: 1) middle of 1950s to the late 1950s - nearly two million Portuguese immigrated to Brazil and United States; 2) late 1950s - following labour market demands, Portuguese emigration started to be directed to new expanding economies of Northern and Central Europe, particularly France (more than 1.5 million Portuguese emigrated in 15 years, most of them to take up jobs in low-wage, low-productivity sectors, but some left as a consequence of the right-wing dictatorial regime); 3) mid-1970s - emigration slowed because of the economic crisis in Europe's major economies and the Carnation Revolution in Portugal; 4) late 1980s and early 1990s - Portugal joined the European Union in 1986 and emigration increased again; 5) early 1990s – there was a reduction in flows and emigration gained new characteristics, namely with the rising skill levels of emigrants (Malheiros, 2002). More recently, mainly after the Troika intervention in Portugal in 2011, there was a considerable increase of people emigrating for high-skill jobs. Portugal has the better prepared generation ever, but the crisis and the austerity obsession left the country empty of opportunities for the youth. At this moment, many young people started looking for jobs in the former Portuguese colonies, namely Mozambique and Angola.

Though Portugal has an history of strong emigration, after the mid-1970s it began to receive significant numbers of immigrants: first from the former African colonies and in the 1990s from Eastern European countries (former members of the Soviet Bloc) and Brazil. These movements have altered the demographic composition of Portugal, shaking the image of homogeneity that the country had of itself and converting Portugal into a more multicultural country, in the most descriptive sense of the word, merely meaning coexistence in a space of different ethnolinguistic and national groups (Númena, 2008: 7).

It has been argued that nationality is not the main criterion for electing targets of racism. According to a study on racism and xenophobia (Númena, 2008), those targets are often Portuguese citizens who are not perceived as such by members of the ethnic majority, as is the case of the majority of Roma and the descendants of African immigrants who have Portuguese citizenship. In that study we can read that "If the Nation is an imagined community, as Benedict Anderson argues, then we can say that many still racially imagine the Portuguese Nation as white (apart from other components of this imagination that escape race, linguistic, religious, etc.)".

3. THE FABRICATED ILLUSION OF A NON-RACIST COUNTRY

In 2011 *The Guardian*[1] published an opinion article written by a Portuguese journalist and a writer with the very expressive title "Portugal is race blind, but not for the right reasons". As acknowledged in the article, Portugal has race crime and daily structural racism,[2] but still "most Portuguese would deny that their country has significant 'racial problems' – that's what they have in America, France or the UK". Recently, a group of policemen were taken to trial because of violence committed against black people from a neighbourhood of the periphery of Lisbon (Cova da Moura) and reacting to that a weekly debate on TV chose as main debate question not how to combat racism but if there is racism in Portugal. Yet, quoting again the article:

> The term 'Black-Portuguese' is unheard of; the word 'race' itself is so rarely mentioned that it sounds strange and foreign"[…].

> There are ideological reasons behind this attitude too. Some argue that identifying people by their race is discriminatory. There seems to be a similar logic behind the fact that Portuguese authorities keep no data on ethnicity or race. Take the recently released census data, which confidently predicts the population is now heading for more than 10 million, but remains completely race blind. Unofficial figures are contradictory and unreliable (There could be 300,000 black Portuguese, I was told a year ago by one researcher. Another said there were 500,000. Another thought the number was much higher).

> You might argue that none of this should matter, of course. And yet, without appropriate data, can you honestly argue that the lack of social mobility in poorer communities has more to do with class than race, as some argue? Ignoring race completely means burying your head in the sand, and accepting Portugal as a country that is uniformly white. We are race blind, but not for the right reasons.

And again:

> Such attitudes are a hangover from the dictatorship years and the "luso-tropicalism" ideology created by the Brazilian Gilberto Freyre in the 1950s, which spread the idea that the Portuguese were better colonizers – and that ongoing British or French soul-searching over race was a result of "bad colonizing'.

This is a crucial question for the analysis of Portuguese situation. With the absence of data concerning race and the lack of credible data on racism it is difficult to properly address the problems. Lusotropicalism is very much present today and we can easily identify it in recent declarations from high-level politicians (namely from the so much loved President or a former Ministry of Defence). Myths of the Portuguese natural desire to mix and of a colonial history much less violent than the colonial history of France or England are always being reinforced:

> Unfortunately Luso-tropicalism is a myth that persists today, dragging the image of benign settlers with it, having survived the revolution of April [April 25 1974], now in other guises, but with the same paternalism, as in the case of Lusophony (Númena, 2008: 9) .

A report on Portugal made by the European Network of legal experts in gender equality and non-discrimination published in November 2017 offers an overview of existing legislation in the country related to discrimination. The report begins precisely with the recognition of this idea of a people tolerant to the 'Other': "Portugal has a long tradition of contact with other cultures and peoples. Due to the 16th century maritime discoveries and the

---

[1] https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2011/sep/12/portugal-race

[2] See Henriques, 2018.

experience of Portuguese emigration to Brazil and Latin America in general, as well as to other countries in Europe, such as France and Germany, in the 1960s, the Portuguese are used to tolerating difference, at least in terms of ethnic origin, race and religion" (Martins, 2017).

However, when we give voice to those who are really involved in these issues, who feel in their daily lives the impact of racism and non-representativeness, we are faced with the opposite of what is conveyed by official discourses. Discussion is starting to be raised and while it is heard mainly in the social media it is starting to appear also in traditional media. The international context, the success of populism in the US and Europe, together with racist ideas being said out loud (as recently happened when a local politician won media space with racist comments against Roma) are obliging Portuguese to talk about it. At this moment there are different proposals in the Portuguese Parliament to change the Law of Nationality and the polemic is installed.

PART II PORTUGUESE ROMA IN THE LITERATURE: STRUCTURAL INEQUALITIES IN DIFFERENT AREAS

The 25th of April 1974 was a turning point for the majority of the Portuguese society. The 1976 Constitution established fundamental rights that for a big part of population were taken for granted until very recently: right to education, right to work, right to health and right to housing. It may be said that life conditions improved considerable for the Portuguese. However, this is not true for the majority of Roma citizens who still haved to struggle against poverty and face problems of exclusion. As expressed by Mendes *et. al* (2016) "they are the poorest ethnic group, with the worst housing conditions, least schooling and the main target of racism and discrimination". It must be clear that the disadvantaged position that Roma are in cannot be explained only by the lack of education or professional credentials but mainly from the discrimination they face (*idem*).

1. EDUCATION

In legal terms, there are no restrictions in Portugal regarding access to education for immigrants, ethnic minorities or refugees, even for those who are in a non-regular situation. There are two essential dimensions for understanding the nature of discrimination in the educational system: the terrain of the representation and practices of various agents operating in the educational field and racism as an institutional dimension (Númena, 2008: 30, 31).

Education data demonstrate that Roma students present the highest levels of school failure and the Roma population has low levels of formal education (Númena, 2008: 31). Women have even lower rates of formal education (Mendes, 2017; Magano and Mendes, 2014). Data from 1998 indicates very low levels of participation in pre-school education by Roma, high levels of failure and early drop-out rates. In 1998, only 55,4% of Roma pupils completed primary education in comparison to the national average of 87,7%. In 2005 (Númena, 2007: 53,54), of 401 Roma surveyed nationwide, 29% of the 89 respondents hadn't completed 4 years of schooling; 42% reported completing at least 4 years of school, 5% reportedly completed 6 years of schooling, 3% reportedly completed 9 years of schooling, while just 1% had concluded secondary education. The impact of this on literacy and employment opportunity is obvious and contributes to a greater reliance on social benefits (ERRC and Númena, 2007). A report published in April 2018 reflects the improvement conquered in education. In 2016/2017, 12 963 Roma children were enrolled in mandatory schooling[3] (DGEEC, 2018).

---

[3] In Portugal, there are 12 years of mandatory schooling (Law nº85/2009, of August 27th). Young people aged between 6 and 18 are considered to be school age, and are supposed to attend school.

As previously mentioned, compared to men, women have higher levels of illiteracy. For decades they have been banned from school. The generation of women of 40 years is a generation of illiterate women, who either did not go to school or attended only the first year of primary school. A study published in 2016 on Roma and education states that, regarding women, the motives for dropping out of school were related to "(…) defence of virginity and preparation for marriage" (Nicolau, 2016). Distrust of the educational system is presented as a reason for not enrolling children of both sexes, but "(…) the withdrawal of girls for being at puberty and the fear of emotional involvement with non-Roma or Roma boys" are still common (CASA-NOVA, 2008 and Nicolau, 2016) and keeps conditioning the access of Roma girls to education.

However, with the renewal of generations, a change is occurring: the generation of women in their thirties presents slightly higher levels of education and the scenario for the ones in their twenties is even better. Magano and Mendes (2014) argue that it is crucial to deeply understand the path of those women and how they conciliate their emancipatory strategy with their familiar and conjugal contexts. In the last years, young Roma activists, men and women, are making an effort to show that the lack of formal education is not the destiny of every Roma woman. Please read below the interesting excerpt of an interview with a Roma woman activist:

> Question - There are several stereotypes established in our social imaginary: all Gypsy women are street vendors, do not study, marry early and with Gypsies, and are mothers of large families.

> Answer - This is as ridiculous as saying that the Portuguese payas women have all moustaches and all wear black. There have always been resistant Gypsy women, though they have not been called feminists. The truth is that they do not have to be called feminist or they consider themselves to be so. There are Gypsy women in every profession and they study. There are already many Gypsy women who are licensed and have a doctorate and who do not marry or have children. That is, they make their choices and fight for them. I have, however, to say that the greatest challenge is to criticize the internal patriarchal structures and, at the same time, try to avoid reinforcing the negative stereotypes about our community, for example, because I argue that all girls should study, I cannot allow this to be seen by the payos as: 'Well, they do not let the girls study because they marry them very early, i.e., I need to avoid that the demands of gender become an instrument of reinforcing alterity and stigmatization of a subaltern and racialized group" [author's translation][4].

In the mentioned report we can observe that there is a very relevant improvement in the presence of Roma women in education. They represent almost half of Roma students enrolled in 2016/2017 (6316 for 6647 men). Scholars have stated that Roma women drop out of mandatory education earlier than men, namely at the end of primary school. However, when we look at the data published by the DGEEC for 2016/2017 we see that, out of the 10762 Roma students enrolled in elementary education, 5247 were women and 5515 were men. In that year, 346 women abandoned elementary school versus 252 men. The report also shows that in secondary school, 9 out of 119 women and 5 out of 256 men dropped out of secondary education. The reasons for the students drop out, both in elementary and secondary education, remains to be explained. Previous studies indicate pressure from traditional values or for other reasons, such as having to help their families financially or by social pressure and discrimination at school. It would also be important to clarify the extent to which students who withdraw from the official school cursus can return later to school, what programs exist to make it happen, and how they are disseminated.

---

[4] https://cientistasfeministas.wordpress.com/2017/08/05/feminismo-cigano-existimos-e-resistimos-entrevista-a-maria-gil/)

Maria José Casa-Nova, in a newspaper article[5] stresses the importance of the increasing number of women in education. In her opinion, "reality is changing" and women are starting the change. Girls are those who show a greater desire in continuing in school". The work done by Roma Associations by sharing good examples and of Roma women who wanted to continue in school while affirming themselves as Roma are having a positive effect on the younger generations. Tiago Brandão (Minister of Education), in an interview,[6] following the publication of the DGEEC report, points out the greater presence of women in education as a victory for the school system by "affirming the respect for cultural diversity and, at the same time, the respect for the right to education for all and the freedom of each one to choose, without pressure, his course of life". More and more Roma women present themselves to the majority society as women and as Roma, and that none of these characteristic work as an impediment to the life course they want to trace. Today, Roma women are more likely to continue their studies, including in higher education. Step by step they are breaking the barriers of prejudice and reviewing what is thought about Roma communities, which demands a reviewing of the existing studies which continue to be cited and which maintains some stereotypical ideas the school cursus of Roma, particularly women.

2. EMPLOYMENT AND SOCIAL BENEFITS FROM STATE

The SII (Social Insertion Income) in an important device for Roma. Most Romani beneficiaries noted the importance of the RSI in their lives. However, upon deeper examination, the SII hardly promotes social inclusion for Roma beneficiaries. On the contrary, it works as another argument for the segregation of the communities (ERRC and Númena, 20007).

Vocational training and employment policies have not contributed to a successful occupational integration of Roma in Portugal as they fail to adapt to the specificities of Romani culture. These difficulties are not exclusively related to the inflexibility of the measures to adapt to individual situations. Although the purpose of the SII programme is to facilitate the re-insertion of excluded persons into the labour market, many persons responsible for its success do not hold this view. It is common to hear them reproducing stereotypes of the laziness of RSI recipients and that most Roma stay home all day doing nothing. One social worker told the ERRC/Númena that 'the RSI SII was understood by the majority of the partners as a sponsorship to poverty' (idem).

Interviews conducted by the ERRC and Númena on this topic point to institutional discrimination and a general mistrust of Roma by social service workers. A considerable amount of social service workers discourse focused on the issue of false claims to the benefit and the need for tighter controls in its allocation. Apparently social assistants seemingly made it their personal responsibility to 'discover' false claims for RSI through their subjective interpretation of 'exterior sigh of wealth' (idem).

The idea that Roma exploit social benefits when they actually don't need them corresponds to a widely held prejudice amongst the Portuguese population further contributing to the negative image of Roma populations. Despite lacking of formal proof of income, because some Roma in Portugal make a living out of visible public activities such as street vending, social service workers appear to believe this is true for all Roma and this impacts the manner in which they administer social services, as noted above in terms of exercising stricter controls on Roma and in their interpretation of 'external signs of wealth'. At the same time, several social service workers noted that sometimes aggressive approach of Roma individuals. By contrast, several of the Roma interviewed by the ERRC/Númena noted that they feel forced to act in such ways in order to receive service as Reception workers

---

[5]   https://www.publico.pt/2018/04/09/sociedade/noticia/quase-duplicou-o-numero-de-alunos-ciganos-na-escola-obrigatoria-1808751

[6]   https://www.publico.pt/2018/04/09/sociedade/entrevista/criancas-ciganas-o-abandono-precoce-das-raparigas-nao-e-inevitavel-1809536

in social service institutions often treat Roma individuals badly and at times seek to prevent Roma from accessing services (*idem*).

The co-operation between social security, which administers RSI payments, and the employment office, responsible for associated training programme, is problematic. According to the study being mentioned many employment workers believe that Roma only go to the employment centre to get their certificate so they can continue to benefit from the RSI, since they really don't want a job. In the case of Roma, the employment agency is not able to offer adequate training programs that would actually facilitate the inclusion of Roma in the labour market – the large majority of the training programs offered are for persons who have concluded mandatory schooling and many Roma haven't completed it being therefore ineligible for said training initiatives (idem).

Added to these problems, social security workers stated that the employment centre is not able to place any Roma in the labour market possibly because of a discrimination process. Employment office workers expressed that, whilst Roma are now accessing employment offices as a result of RSI requirements, they are generally unable to place Roma individuals due to employer reluctance which means that the problem is not in the willingness of Roma to apply for jobs but in actually manage the interview phase and be hired. According to various interviewees, employers under similar conditions always give preference to non-Roma candidates, as the employer is the one that chooses futures employees from a number of candidates presented to them by the labour office (idem).

In several cases, some of them reported in the interviews conducted under the scope of this report, not only Roma are not chosen in the employment interviews but are dismissed when the employers discover their ethnicity. In some cases, Roma are able to hide for a while their identity, but as soon as they are discovered the employers dismiss them. The solution found by many workers is to hide their cultural identity in order to keep their jobs.

3. HOUSING

Government interventions in the area of housing are not planned exclusively for members of the Romani community but encompass all groups that live in substandard housing conditions. The Special Relocation Programme (SRP) started in 1993.[7] This programs aims to eliminate shantytowns and to transfer their population to council estates. Although there is no exact data, it is known that many Roma families have benefited from this programme (ERRC and Númena, 2007). While these social housing programmes are often the only avenue available to Roma to improve their housing situation and therefore are one of the most important social benefits received by the Roma community, in Portugal the re-housing process has been the subject of fierce debate. There are a series of problems with the re-housing process and, as the SRP is included in the National Action Programme (NAP) in its current form, the NAP does not address these problems at all. Portuguese re-housing policies have resulted in the proliferation of segregated slums in major cities where many Roma live, which many see as a locus of social exclusion and criminality. It is estimated that roughly 31% of all Roma in Portugal live in precarious housing conditions and this is not limited to shantytowns, but extends also to council housing estates constructed within the framework of the special re-housing program (SRP). The processes of re-housing often don't take into account the cultural specificities of different ethnic groups and doesn't promote intercultural coexistence.

The most recent report by the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA, 2018) published in April 2018 gives more strength to complaints and provides more information on the discrimination felt by Roma, not only in Portugal but in Europe in general. The FRA analysed surveys conducted in 2011 and 2016, with 34 000 people in the following countries: Bulgaria, Croatia, Czech Republic, Greece, Hungary and Portugal. In both years,

---

[7] Decree-Law nº163/93, of 7 May.

Portugal was the country where the Roma had more complains about discrimination in access to housing (67% of respondents in 2011, and 75% in 2016).

The FRA concluded that 80% of European Roma live in homes without water and access to potable water can be compared to those in Ghana or Nepal. In the press release published in April, the FRA draws attention to the detrimental effect that these living conditions have on the progress made in the areas of education, health and employment (FRA, 2018). They recommend the elimination of segregated housing, a better access to utilities such as electricity and water, and more social housing (FRA, 2018). It is interesting to note that, at the beginning of 2018, a report published by the European Union indicates precisely that "in Portugal, there are no general patterns of housing segregation and discrimination against the Roma" (Martins, 2017:61). As we can see, the reality is far from going in that direction.

4. HEALTH

Minority groups generally present higher incidence of cardiovascular diseases, diabetes, asthma and cancer. The causes of this reality are multifactorial and are sustained on economic factors and discrepancies between cultural values (Betancourt et al, 2003). In Portugal, the average life expectancy of Roma is 15 years less than the rest of the population, infant mortality is 5 times superior of the European mean and the average age for first child is 17 years old (Comissão Parlamentar de Ética, Sociedade e Cultura, 2009). Roma comply with the vaccination plan and attend some of the family planning and prenatal appointments, especially when encouraged by social security. The main topics that still have some problems are dental hygiene, psychiatric diseases, drug addiction and improper eating habits that lead to pathologies, like diabetes, high blood pressures and other health problems in adult life (Mendes et al, 2014).

The results of an inquiry administered between 2007 and 2009 to 7154 Roma families (Magano & Mendes, 2013) showed that the majority of Roma are inserted in the national health system (Serviço Nacional de Saúde – SNS) and that health standards are heavily influenced by low levels of education. The most common diseases are pathologies of the respiratory system (asthma, chronic bronchitis) followed by high levels of cholesterol and high blood pressure – precisely the opposite of the non-Roma population, the incidence of these pathologies are related to housing precariousness. In terms of access to medication, there are high levels of consumption of antipyretics and anti-inflammatory drugs, most of which are not prescribed by a health professional. There are also drugs that are prescribed and not taken, like pregnancy pill, cholesterol drugs and those for diabetes.

Regarding the case of the Roma, the health situation of this groups is related to inequalities concerning access/utilization of resources (FSG, 2007) but also the way health is viewed by the group itself. Traditionally, for Roma, health is not seen as a primary need as long as it is not an impediment to the execution of daily life. Their concern arises when the symptoms begin to be limiting and disabling, which drives them to demand immediate and decisive intervention. Thus, they turn more quickly to emergency services than to health centre services (Silva *et. al.*, 2000).

The FSG (2077: 22) recommends the qualification of health professional to accept the differences regarding "(…) a set of cultural elements that determine their attitudes [of Roma communities] and behaviours in relation to health and illness as well as in relation to the health system". The differences presented by the FSG regards the avoidance of primary care centres and a greater use of emergency services. Even health professionals, when inquired about what they know about the health of the Roma, reproduce the idea that they abandon care when the symptoms disappear, that they continue to avoid specialities such as family planning and genecology (Brito, 2016).

However, Bruno Gonçalves, a Roma activist, explained that the main problem, especially in the older generations, is illiteracy (Brito, 2016: 45). According to him, "Roma still suffer from this issue and sometimes it is difficult to

explain the message". Roma associations have been very active, producing audio-visual media to explain to the communities what is wrong and what is potentially dangerous for their health. Given the increasing number of Roma enrolled in school, the issue of illiteracy will gradually be resolved. On the other hand, if Roma communities are increasingly sensitized to correct health practices, health professionals still fall short of what is expected. They continue to reproduce stereotypes, waiting in advance for certain behaviours from Roma patients. Many health professionals continue to fear violent reactions from Roma, which in many cases puts Roma in a defensive position. This defensive position is reflected also in the presence of the extended family near the patient, which is not to disrupt the work of the health professionals, but really to accompany the patient so they don't feel abandoned. Being accompanied by the family is very important for the Roma, and Bruno Gonçalves recommends a greater intercultural training not only for health professionals, but also for the technicians who are in the reception of health centres and hospitals, so they better understand what is at stake for Roma patients and their families and by this, avoid conflicts (Brito, 2016:47).

PART III STATE INTERVENTION

1. THE CONSTRUCTION OF ROMA AS THE INFERIOR "OTHER"

Regarding Roma communities, Sílvia Maeso and Marta Araújo, two leading researchers on racism in Portugal and Europe, argue that there is a dominant approach towards the Roma/Gypsy "that can be defined as pathological". Public policies that promote the so called active inclusion and the empowerment initiatives are implemented as a civilizing and disciplinary programme. Self-proclaimed anti-racist measures may ephemerally celebrate Roma culture, but they ultimately work as explanations for their uncivilized, non-modern circumstances and for the assumed need for surveillance of their status as beneficiaries (e.g. of the Social Insertion Income) (Maeso and Araújo, 2011).

The analysis shows how racism is reproduced and anti-racism is marginalized through three interrelated regimes of denial. The first regime of denial is the ethnic/racial vs. civic principles and feeds race/colour blind arguments. It relates to the existence of an official narrative of unity and homogeneity of the nation as a historical characteristic. The argument used is that the state and the nation have been the same for centuries and that universal citizenship is the civic solution. According to the authors, by the time they wrote, "the lack of data on complaints, discriminatory/racist acts and crimes, and of any outcomes of these complaints, shows the poor performance of the public bodies in charge of monitoring racism, inspecting the complaints and proposing specific anti-racist policies". Maeso and Araújo add that this argument is connected with the idea that having been scientifically proved that 'races' do not exist as a biological/genetic phenomenon, the word race shall not be used. In the case of Roma, it is argued that they are victims of racism based on cultural, not biological, characteristics (idem).

This idea of cultural differences goes along with the second regime of denial: racism is a universal individual disposition towards difference: 'we' need to learn to accept other cultures. Racism is seen as resulting from ignorance and anti-racism is framed as a strategy aimed at learning how to accept other cultures. The researchers argue that this approach, common in the Portuguese policy, depoliticizes/evaporates racism and results in anti racist measures to the 'cultural sphere' focussing on the ephemeral celebration of the other's culture (idem).

The two previous forms of denial mirror in the third and last form: the 'inclusion' of marginalized groups in the majority society. The discourse on 'inclusion' is configured as a 'civilizing mission' that exonerates the state from the need to act on its structures. The policies focus on correcting Roma 'pathologies of character' and pressuring them into 'cultural change', so they don't feel apart from the majority society. As a result, racism "is reproduced through the constant ontologisation of the Roma/Gypsies as 'pathological' subjects, this being the structural

condition addressed by public policies." Racism is not properly addressed as it is seen as something that occurs "in extreme situations/attitudes and not to the regular way in which authorities make political decisions regarding housing or schooling for instance (idem).

2. RECOGNITION OF MINORITIES

Portugal has no politics for recognizing national minorities. The country ratified the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (FCPNM) in an act of political solidarity, having in mind the historical question of nationalities in Central and Eastern part of Europe, and aiming at reinforcing peace and stability on the European continent. However in 2007, Portugal officially recognized the existence of one ethnic minority, 'the Roma Community' via its Permanent Mission to the European Council and in response to the Advisory Committee of FCNM.

3. DATA COLLECTION

Portugal does not include the variable ethnicity in the Census. As a result, there is no credible data about the current number of Roma living in Portugal, their geographical location and lifestyle, information considered crucial for the creation of appropriate measures of intervention. Non-consensual sources give numbers that vary from 20 000 to 100 000 (Mendes, Magano and Candeias, 2014).

Mendes *et. al.* (2016: 7) argue that "there is no statistical information on Ciganos at national level since the Portuguese Constitution sets several restrictions on ethnic statistics and any other element allowing the ethnic identification of citizens". The Portuguese Constitution declares equality and imposes universality of rights. Article 13 states that "no one shall be privileged, favoured, prejudiced, deprived of any right or exempted from any duty on the basis of ancestry, sex, race, language, place of origin, religion, political or ideological beliefs, education, economic situation, social circumstances or sexual orientation" (CRP, article 13). According to the Law of Personal Data Protection, the processing of personal data related to philosophical or political beliefs, party or union affiliation, religious belief, private life and racial or ethnic origin, as well as the processing of data concerning health or sex life, including the genetic data is prohibited.[8]

This scenario means that, officially, there are no records on the ethnic identity of Portuguese inhabitants. However, between 1991 and 2000 some statistical data were collected in order to prove unequal rates of school achievement. Data on Roma communities continue to be collected unofficially without being made public. This policy has been criticized by activists who argue this situation creates an obstacle to prove the presence of structural racism and its impact in the country.

The situation is about to change as the government wants to include ethnic information on the 2021 Census. The Working Group Census 2021 - Ethnic-Racial Issues was created under the coordination of High Commissioner for Migration (ACM) and the Secretariat of State for Citizenship and Equality. The composition of this group was criticized by a collective of activists in an open letter published in Portuguese newspaper of reference. We will come back to this topic in the third part of the report.

---

[8] Law nr. 67/98, October 26, article 7.º, nr. 1.

4. POLICIES AND PROGRAMMES TO INCLUDE ROMA

4.1. KEY YEARS

Twenty years have passed since the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (FCNM) entered into force. Signed in 1995 and effective in 1998, this Convention is described by the European Commission as "one of the most comprehensive treaties designed to protect the rights of persons belonging to national minorities".[9] According to Silvia Maeso and Marta Araújo, though "racism has not featured highly in these treaties, conventions and recommendations, in terms of providing an understanding of the historical marginalisation, racial segregation and repression experienced by the Roma in Europe", it " established a turning point in the legal and political approach to combating discrimination and monitoring the situation of the Roma in the different European states" (Maeso and Araújo, 2011).

1996 is also a landmark, having been taken measures to promote the employment of disadvantaged groups. Among other initiatives, the Guaranteed Minimum Income - now called Social Insertion Income (SII)[10] - and the Social Market for Employment (SME)[11] were implemented. The Working Group for Equality and Inclusion of Roma Communities was also launched (Maeso and Araújo, 2011).

4.2. PROGRAMMES AND POLICIES

Since 1990s two parallel processes have been occurring. The first includes policies and measures devoted to socio-economic and employment 'inclusion' that establish specific groups as 'vulnerable' and facing serious problems in terms of social and professional integration. Roma are in some cases mentioned as the target-beneficiaries[12] and are presented suffering with 'inequalities and discrimination in access to rights by specific groups' and their situation is implicitly described as related to 'traditional situations of poverty'. The second are institutional initiatives to combat racism and xenophobia, closely linked to the configuration of immigration as a central topic in the political debate and, according to Maeso and Araújo, in this case, Portuguese authorities showed a hesitant approach to the Roma (Maeso and Araújo, 2011).

Maeso and Araújo argue that it may be considered that Portugal has avoided the political visibility of Roma/Gypsies. The authors note that it was precisely in 2007, when Portugal recognised the existence of the Roma Community as an ethnic minority, that the High Commission for Immigration and Ethnic Minorities (ACIME) became the High Commission for Immigration and Intercultural Dialogue (ACIDI), dropping any official reference to 'ethnic minorities' (Maeso and Araújo, 2011).

The ACIDI incorporates and coordinates a considerable part of the integration/inclusion policies and programmes, such as the CHOICES[13]. Responding to pressure from the AC-FCNM, in 2007 was launched the Roma Communities Support Agency (GACI)[14]. It has low profile within the ACIDI and a low budget, focusing mainly on

---

[9] Council of Europe, https://www.coe.int/en/web/minorities

[10] In Portuguese, "Rendimento Social de Inserção" (RSI).

[11] In Portuguese, "Mercado Social de Emprego" (MSE).

[12] 2001 National Plan for Employment; 2003-2006; 2008-2010 National Plans for Inclusion.

[13] Programa ESCOLHAS.

[14] Gabinete de Apoio às Comunidades Ciganas.

following projects funded under the CHOICES programme that target Roma as beneficiaries. In 2007 was also created a website with online resources called "CIGA-NOS!".

According to the authors, one of the most relevant initiatives launched by the ACIDI concerning Roma was the 2009 Municipal Mediators Pilot Project (Maeso and Araújo, 2011). The figure of the Roma mediator have unofficially existed in Portugal for about 20 years. It emerged in the 1990s with the aim of promoting social inclusion by facilitating ethnic minorities' integration. However it was only in 2001 that a crucial legal step was taken for the statutory recognition of the sociocultural mediator. [15] The law refers that the socio-cultural mediator works for the integration of immigrants and ethnic minorities, strengthening intercultural dialogue and social cohesion. It also establishes that it must give preference to citizens belonging to ethnic groups who will receive specific training. As in other European countries the practice of mediation was developed through projects supported by the European Social Fund. These projects use different designations for mediators but share the main aims of socio-cultural mediation and recruit people that belong to target groups (Castro *et. al.*, 2010).

In 2009, ACIDI created the Project of Municipal Social Mediators that places Municipal Mediators at the service of city councils or initiatives promoted by them, with the main objective of improving the access of Roma communities to local services and equipment, but also of facilitating communication between culturally differentiated groups, translate the content of interaction, prevent and manage conflict (Castro *et. al.*, 2010). The regulation of the project establishes that mediators must have at least four years of Basic Education, be trusted at local level by the different socio-cultural groups, have communicative ability and ease of building empathy and consensus.[16] The evaluation of the first year of the project revealed that mediators were mainly young males belonging to the target communities with low formal education and not included in the labour market. From the 15 hired mediators in the first year, only 5 had 9 or more years of formal education (minimum compulsory schooling) and only 1 had a labour contract. Most of them were unemployed or worked as hawkers. Importantly, 4 out of 15 had experience of associative leadership (idem). After this pilot-project, Portugal participated on ROMED 1 and ROMED 2 and in 2017 it created the Association of Roma Mediators.

ROMED1 and ROMED2 were positively evaluated. According to Fernando Santos, these programs had a significant impact on the self-esteem and confidence of participants, with the final report of the projects stating that "some members expressed these ideas saying: 'we feel important'" (Santos, 2016). In April 2018, as a consequence of the National Strategy for the Integration of Roma Communities 2013-2020, a new program for intercultural municipal mediators was created by the High Commission for Migration. At the time of writing applications were open for municipalities who wanted to build a network of cultural mediators. The teams may vary according to the level of intervention they propose to ensure. Teams will always have one coordinator and between one and four mediators. The teams must be heterogeneous, with people from different backgrounds, ethnicity, nationality, age, migratory experiences, vocational training and academic qualifications in order to give a better intervention in different contexts. The intercultural mediators hired to be part of the team are designated by civil society organizations, preferably, by migrant associations and Roma communities. Higher education and professional experience are valued, although they aren't mandatory. However, for mediators who have not completed secondary education, the attendance of school or any equivalent course is encouraged during the duration of the program. Ideally, the mediator should be a member of a migrant community or Roma community or a Portuguese citizen with a personal/professional experience of intervention in contexts of ethnic-cultural diversity (ACM, 2018).

---

[15] Law nr. 105/2001

[16] Regulation of the Pilot-Project of Municipal Socio-cultural Mediators, Presidência do Conselho de Ministros, Alto Comissariado para a Imigração e Diálogo Intercultural, I.P

The ethnicity of the mediator is of one the main controversial aspects of the debate on socio-cultural mediators. However, in the empirical field the authors of the referred evaluation realized that it was consensual for the parts involved that recruiting mediators from the targeted Roma communities was mainly an advantage though some disadvantages could be identified (lack of impartiality and of neutrality and lack of recognition by some Roma families) (Castro *et. al.*, 2010).

In 2017, the High Commissioner for Migration (ACM) – which replaced ACIDI in 2014 - created the Support Centre for Roma Communities (GACI)[17] on the Department of Support for the Integration and Valorization of Diversity. The main goals of this new centre are to support the integration, appreciation and defense of rights and duties of the Roma communities in their diversity. Officially, its tasks include: a) collaboration in the processes of conception, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of public policies related to the Roma community, nationally and internationally: b) acknowledging the real and effective needs of the Roma community and the answers that exist at local, regional, national and international level; c) supporting and advising public and private organizations and also local, national and international networks concerning the integration of Roma communities; d) promoting the production of knowledge, the exchange and sharing of information and relevant contacts to the integration of Roma communities; e) promoting the capacitation and participation of Roma communities; f) promoting the exercise of active citizenship by Roma communities; g) promoting initiatives to raise awareness in public opinion and promote intercultural dialogue; h) promoting education for the valorisation of cultural diversity of Roma communities; i) assuming the creation and monitoring of programs and projects that promote the integration of the Roma communities; k) conceiving materials of awareness and formation related to Roma communities.[18]

PART IV WHO REPRESENTS THE ROMA? THE PERSPECTIVE OF ROMA COMMUNITIES

1. FOUR AND A HALF DECADES OF DEMOCRACY: ARE DEMOCRACY AND RIGHTS FOR ALL?

In 2011, facing a very serious situation of economic crisis, the Portuguese government asked for external help and came to apply for a bailout program. As a result, a group of representatives of the European Commission, the European Central Bank and the International Monetary Fund – the Troika – went to Lisbon to promote a rescue plan. In order to receive an international loan of €78 billion, the Portuguese government signed with the Troika a Memorandum of Understanding on May 17 2011 that defined conditions of public policy to be followed by the Portuguese State until 2014 (Abreu *et. al.,* 2013: 63-75). The austerity measures and the labour law changes had a deep impact on Portuguese society, namely by increasing precarious forms of employment, raising the numbers of unemployed, the loss of autonomy of trade unions, the reinforcement of asymmetries in the labour market, the sharp fall in the purchasing power of households, and the high number of working-age citizens leaving the country.[19]

From 2011 to 2013 there was a great intensification and radicalization of protests in Portugal, some of them reminiscent of the first years of Portuguese democracy (Hermes *et. al.*; 2015: 46, 47). Portugal had the best-educated generation of all times as a result of four decades of democracy and investment on public schools and

---

[17] Gabinete de Apoio às Comunidades Ciganas.

[18] To a more detailed list of the Programmes and Laws concerning Roma needs, please see the Appendix 1.

[19] On this topic, please read also D6.2.

universities. However unemployment among people aged under 24 and looking for work hit 36.6% in 2012.[20] Paying the mortgage became problematic for many and buying a house a faraway dream to the youth. In the 21st century democratic certainties were not so certain anymore: public education, public health, right to labour, housing and right to dignity were threatened.

This narrative of what happened eludes an important part of the history that was mentioned in the introduction and was made clear by one young Roma activist in a public speech I quote below. The protests brought a large group of people to the streets protesting for the loss of rights. However not everyone lost their rights: a) some people were not affected by the crisis (intimate civil society); b) some people never got them (uncivil civil society).[21] The Portuguese Roma communities are part of this later group.

> Half of the families that live in precarious houses, i.e., tents are Gypsy. We spoke here about the 25th of April. There is a reality before 25th of April and a reality after the 25th of April. Before April 25th, we had slums and there were white people in the slums. After the 25th of April there were measures and concrete political actions and today you have almost no whites in slum neighbourhoods. 0,8% of white people live in precarious houses. For the Gypsy communities, there is 50%. Half of the Roma community lives in slums. There was no April 25 for the Roma, nor for the blacks. Of course, among whites, there are the richest and the poorest, but in society there are whites and non-whites, we can never forget that [...].

> Precariousness, ok, let's talk about precariousness. Gypsies and blacks live in precarious conditions for way longer than you. 2008... 2011... the crisis... I just though "but I am living in crisis for my entire life, ok, you are going through a bad period, that's a good thing, now we can talk about it" [...]. It is just like the housing issue in Lisbon now. There is the problem of gentrification, but they forget that gentrification started with racialization with the Gypsies and the blacks living outside of the city. And now that the problem reaches the white middle class the political parties in the political campaigns say "housing for the middle class".[22]

Olga Magano is a 68 year old Roma woman activist. She experienced both fascist and democratic regimes. When asked about the changes she felt after the Carnation Revolution her answer was quite surprising. She states that discrimination and fear she feels are higher today than during dictatorship. In Portugal extreme right parties are forbidden and the fresh memory of the fascist regime prevents extreme right ideas to be said out loud, but this does not mean that Portugal is untouched by the international right-wing populist trend.

> No doubt there were changes, there were. I was Olga before the 25th of April and Olga after the 25th of April. Before the 25th of April, I was known as the daughter of Ti Domingues, who was my father, and today I am known as the Gypsy. Back then it wouldn't cross their minds to call me that. People recognized Ti Domingues as a person just like them and the family of Ti Domingues. Not now. Today it's the Gypsy, names are forgotten!*23*

Discrimination against Roma and the lack of an efficient state protection pervades everyone's speech in this research.

---

[20] https://www.ft.com/content/67d4921a-beb6-11e1-b24b-00144feabdc0

[21] For the three circles of civil society (intimate, strange, uncivil), see the introduction of this report and Santos, 2002.

[22] Piménio Ferreira, Romani activist, public presentation "Racism in Portugal: Challenges to the Left in the 21st century", 12 January 2018.

[23] Interview 3.

Even if I make a complaint, I go from victim to defendant in a moment. I'm a Gypsy. He doesn't look at me as a citizen, he will look at me with the representations all associated with being a Gypsy they have. And that worries me a lot, a lot. I have some fear of the extreme right and the growth of nationalisms in Europe. People say "I'm glad they didn't reach us", of course they didn't, but we have some sectors of our society that remain very racist. Institutional racism is the one that predominates the most. Direct racism, you call me this or that..., but what hurts most is the institutional racism that selects us, which puts us at lower levels, when it should not.[24]

The discomfort and fear of using public services by Roma, namely public hospitals, are present in almost every interviews and testimonies collected online.

> The discourse is institutionalized. We see this discourse in the financial bureaus - not only from the people who are waiting, but from the services, the staff - we see it in the hospitals, we see in health centres, we see it in shopping centres. The mere look burns in! The mere look burns in! It's something that hurts, you can't explain! Something I never felt before April 25. Today, after April 25, I feel a look that burns into you, it burns, burns, you can't imagine. I even somewhat fear walking alone on the streets, because the hate speech is so, so widespread. When TV mentions Gypsy it's always something bad, it is never a good thing. There always be a Gypsy with a shotgun, even if it happened 20 years ago. This is so institutionalized it's frightening. I have a name![25]

> Once my mother felt sick and I went with her to the hospital and as soon as I got to the hospital I heard voices saying 'they must think they own the place'. I'm getting to the hospital with my mother passed out, I'm nervous, and you hear these comments... I just thought 'I'll let it go otherwise it's going to be worse for the person inside'. You have to shut up and keep your head down.[26]

As the first part of this report shows, Portuguese democracy was developed on the basis of a race blind ideology. Racism was never a main issue. The idea of Lusotropicalism was never seriously addressed and is still present in political speeches and policies.

How can we explain Olga Magano's testimony and concerns expressed by everyone? Is racism against Roma higher today? During dictatorship social inequalities were levelled from below in a rural country with high social contrasts. Democracy created a white middle class, defined universalist laws and programs and ignored the problem of racism.

Hypothesis to explain the present:

- When the middle class started suffering from the effects of the economic crisis and austerity measures and predicting a future worse than the present, scapegoats had to be found – Roma communities, immigrants, Black people, etc. Most people don't want to change the system because for a long time it worked for them or they don't believe it is possible, so they must find different explanations for the current condition;

---

[24] Interview 2.

[25] Interview 3.

[26] Noel, Gypsy Young Women quoted in a reportage by Frianças and Botelho (2018).

- With the certainties being shaken, there is a symbolic need to show people's superiority by emphasizing their distance from the "other", the excluded, the invisible, the ones who have no voice and are classified as lazy and/or dishonest.
- The ghettoization of Roma Communities during the last four decades in slums created an enormous distance between them and the majority society.

2. "Can the subaltern speak"? The invisibility of Portuguese Roma communities

The data we discuss in this topic may be articulated with subaltern studies, post-colonial theory, decolonial perspectives and Epistemologies of the South. Western democracies define a pattern, what is normal, where is and who has the relevant knowledge, who are the voices to be heard. Roma communities in Portugal have their voices silenced by a society that refuses to fully recognize its own racism and create specific and proper measures to combat racist oppression.

Because of paternalism or manifest racism, Roma communities are not expected to speak by themselves, but to be explained by the owners of knowledge and power. Other people produce policy documents to address their problems. Good will is many times paternalist and does not change the big picture of a racist and colonial world were some groups are allowed to stay but are not considered part of it. Integration tends to signify assimilation or tolerance and never real recognition. This blocks the possibilities of Roma and other minorities to define racism in their own terms and produce awareness of structural racism. In this context solutions and politics are mainly cosmetic.

> We in Portugal have something really cool to pair with Gypsyphobia that is the most sympathetic and cuddly form of Gypsyphobia, which is white paternalism. What is white paternalism? "We whites are able to help others". And they only know how to do something for the Gypsies, if in return there is that feeling that I am being good, I am being a good Christian... or I am being a good person. And how do they want to do that? By replacing us. They love being our protectors, we blacks and we Gypsies, we have no right to have a voice.[27]

Roma are often invited by institutions and associations to show the inclusiveness and interculturality of their work. However, frequently they are expected to be an ornament and have no power to define anything important. As Olga Mariano puts it:

> There are a lot of people who ask us to go talk here or there, but everything, in my view, to reach their own goals - you know? "Ah, we brought a person from the Gypsy community, to speak ...", but all within in that perspective of serving the interests of this organization, that association .... It's really great to say "ah, I interviewed a Gypsy person". This is all I'm worth, I'm just good for being a platform for non-Gypsy institutions to achieve their goals, not to make my voice heard. Nowadays I'm refusing almost everything. Then they tell me "ah, so you're not doing this interview, are you not...?". What for? To serve the others? If I'm doing it, it's to speak in the first person. I want to be my voice.[28]

The idea of the production of Gypsy's invisibility crosses all the interviews and some public online testimonies. It is felt everywhere and from everyone. This is a very important claim of Roma activists.

---

[27] Piménio Ferreira, TV Programme Prós e Contras (XV) "Portugal, País Racista?", 17 July 2017, episode 23.

[28] Interview to Olga Mariano, 13 March 2018.

In the introduction we already mentioned the need to think about the extractivist model of research. The challenge launched by Olga Mariano about producing knowledge with Roma and not only about them (see the quotation below) deserves a very important self-reflection from every social researcher.

> Academy has been one of the main accomplices of the hegemonic political power, because academia has produced false knowledge, like Luso-tropicalism, like this idea of racialization and exotification of the Gypsy people, especially when it defines them from a behavioural and cultural point of view in a highly reified way. Just as in the past you had Jesuits legitimizing slavery with theories like Cain's descendants, and therefore we are all cursed, you have had the academy justifying a racist system during a long time. Some studies were commissioned by the state.[29]

> I think it's important, when you [the interviewer] have these kind of projects, to invite Gypsy institutions as partners. I'm frank, I am a very blunt person, what I'm saying isn't politically correct, but if it's about Gypsy it is with Gypsy! [...]. If it is about the Gypsy community, it is with the Gypsy community, not for the Gypsy community. If I am committed to giving my testimony as a Gypsy woman, I Olga Mariana, I'll be committed in double. In this case, I'm always in a rush […] Our main goal is to minimize the social gap between Gypsy and non-Gypsy. We don't want assimilation, we want the sharing, coming together. We can give really good things.[30]

2.2. POLITICAL PARTIES

Structural racism is not properly addressed so we watch the circularity of exclusion: structural racism prevents Roma to reach the centres of power and their invisibility is reproduced by the non-recognition of their claims and the absence of adequate politics.

> I feel excluded from both the left and the right ... my definition of the left is very different from the definition of the left of a white racialized subject, which is much more than an economy that happens to be dominated only by white people [...] Everything remains to be done in our Portuguese society, including having parties that can be left-wing and keep in mind every claim and every new demand that has been muffled, silenced and invisibilised, especially from the Gypsy communities [...] Our left has been failing in its class reductionism or its excess of paternalism […]. Our left has to accept that we have different structural problems, with different origins, in need of different solutions. And the best way to do that is not to assume that you have a power of attorney and are the saviour of society. Our left must have in its structure people who are not part of the elites, who have other visions and other perspectives. It is not enough to have a black person and a Gypsy person and believe that diversity is guaranteed, because I know lots of Gypsy with whom I have lots of differences in political terms, we have different visions. Then we have the issue of communities having different needs: there are communities that have more urgency around housing, there are communities that have more urgency around education, there are communities that have more urgency around

---

[29] Piménio Ferreira, Romani activist, public presentation "Racism in Portugal: Challenges to the Left in the 21st century", 12 January 2018.

[30] Interview 3.

health. We're not keeping in mind the plurality that exists within the Gypsy community. It seems that white folks are plural and Gypsys are all monolithic, they are homogeneous. Our left has to exist, we have to create a left, it has to be done together: Gypsy, blacks, immigrants, whites. We must recognize that they are racialized subjects and realize that there are systems that put us in different positions of power and that these positions of power have to be attacked [...]. Our left sometimes likes to cause a controversy – the André Ventura case - but the truth is that in all municipal elections we have Gypsyphobic speeches trying to win votes at the expense of hatred of Gypsy. André Ventura was neither the first nor the last [...] There were CDS Councillors giving Gypsyphobic speeches [Popular Party – right wing], there were Councillors giving these speeches in Entroncamento, and it is PS [Socialist Party – moderate left]. It wasn't just PSD, it wasn't just CDS [...]. This is the problem with our political parties, they're up there in the elites' sphere and don't even think about solving concrete problems. Find what concrete problems, discuss concrete problems. We have our public housing projects in urgent need of intervention because they are overcrowded and in the ghetto. Nobody cares. We have people living in slums, with people in dire need of water, electricity, without the least minimum conditions, they've been there for decades, and no political party cares. Where is our left? Just now we had a discussion about legalizing cannabis and nobody cares about housing? Not long ago we had a stupid debate because of an actress who said an outrage about Gypsy. Everyone was outraged, okay, but are you worried about the Roma people's life? [...].[31]

Now that in fact, no party is willing to have Gypsies, no. There is one or the other, like Bloco that is the only one that makes invitations. The others don't make invitations. They don't even want to think about having Gypsy candidates because they think they can lose votes and that's the reality. Why do mayors, in some parts of the country, do nothing, do not have any kind of policy directed at Gypsy communities because they know they can lose votes. Public opinion is very strong ... the pressures on the municipal executives are enormous and we do not want to realize this, but we know that it's what happens.[32]

Joacine Katar (black women activist) and Piménio Ferreira (Roma activist) recently wrote a newspaper article in which they challenged the Portuguese left to combat the racism that according to them is present in four political positions:

1) The refusal or relegation of the idea that racism is structural, therefore political and social (and historical), and the error and stubbornness in aiming to struggle against individuals, not the structures and the functioning of institutions, allowing the perpetuation of historic oppression and systemic violence on part of the population;

2) The persistence in the Left of the idea that the struggle against racism can only exist within the framework of class struggle, a distorted perspective and that shows the deep ignorance and disinterest for racial issues, since class struggle and capitalism have a racial content that cannot be ignored, since the capitalist system has racism as one of its pillars;

3) The composition of the left-wing parties (and the consequent composition of the Assembly of the Republic), which do not represent the diversity of Portuguese society, and being representation the core of democracy, entire communities are excluded, and therefore also the defence of their interests and their worldview (which

---

[31] Piménio Ferreira, Romani activist, public presentation "Racism in Portugal: Challenges to the Left in the 21st century", 12 January 2018.

[32] Interview to Bruno Gonçalves, 12 March 2018.

will certainly convey the resolution of problems that affect the whole community) in the space of political decisions. If nothing else, it is the quality of our democracy that is at stake;

4) False representation by a Left that does not commit itself to deconstructing its racism and condones the hegemonic positions of society and which generally chooses one or two "representatives" of ethnic minorities to appear on its lists, but in non-eligible seats.[33]

2.3. STATE

Roma activists cooperate with state institutions, namely with High Commission for Migration and the Secretary of State to Equality, but they feel they are not really involved in the creation of politics. There seems to be goodwill from both sides but the processes are not built over horizontal structures. When we talk about a horizontal dialogue, it means that all parts must be equally heard and seriously taken for the construction of a solution and no speech is more credible because of the position of the speaker. This implies that everyone present recognize that has some knowledge and is also ignorant, that has something to teach and something to learn. Some progresses are pointed by activists, namely the recognition of structural racism by the former Secretary of State for Equality and a more open posture to real dialogue that is being followed by her successor. However, many criticisms are made as we can see from a collection of selected interview excerpts.

A) COLONIAL STATE STRUCTURES

Piménio Ferreira points the fact that after the 25th of April we did not watch to what could be called the decolonization of state structures.

> When we put an end to Estado Novo, when we reach the 25th of April and we are all in freedom and democracy, when we do our political infographics, and what you see, basically, is "ok Salazar died and basically the fascists died", but you have the same descendants of the same colonialists, the descendants of the same Estado Novo in the current political parties, the parties that are in the government, the assembly of the republic and the institutions, and it is they who are lying and saying that we have a pretty neat past. It is they who say that Portugal is not racist and it is they who want to define what is racism and what is not racism and how to struggle against racism […]. They don't want to accept that when I talk about racism I'm not talking about an interpersonal relationship, because I don't care about a guy that I run into on the street and calls me a Gypsy or who doesn't think I'm a Gypsy because I'm very polite. When I am talking about racism, I am talking about racism that hurts, original racism [...].[34]

The idea that state structures and democratic organs must include Roma activists is very strong in the activists' discourses.

---

[33] Joacine Katar Moreira and Piménio Ferreira, "Racismo em Portugal: desafios para a esquerda no século XXI. Desafiamos a esquerda a combater o racismo e a discriminação presentes nestas quatro posições políticas, *Publico*, 29 January 2018. Available here:

https://www.publico.pt/2018/01/29/sociedade/opiniao/racismo-em-portugal-desafios-para-a-esquerda-no-seculo-xxi-1799860

[34] Piménio Ferreira, Roma activist, public presentation "Racism in Portugal: Challenges to the Left in the 21st century", 12 January 2018.

We really need someone with a voice, a voice! Especially in the Assembly of the Republic. There has to be somebody. There has to be someone that runs for office, be it whatever political party, and who has a seat and talks and exposes. No more other people talking for us. Because it's very important. It's often said that foolish words fall on deaf ears and it is true. For example, they talk about arranged marriages in the Gypsy, a lie! Is not true! There are early marriages against parent's wishes. No Gypsy father wants his daughter to marry before reaching 18. It's the girls that, culturally, since they are not allowed to date, to become autonomous, to be the owners of their own life, they marry. They get together, they do not marry. For us, living together is identified as marriage. Because whoever touches a Gypsy girl, gets married. That is cultural, now, arranged marriages, they're not cultural [...] Do tell me that they debate forced marriages by parents. That's discussed there in the Assembly of the Republic, but there is no one to explain things there. But they don't debate that when if I go to buy a house, they won't sell it to me because I'm a Gypsy. And then, on top of it, they'll come out and say that the Gypsies do not want to work. So, get me a job to see and I'll show you if I work or not. And when I go to work, I have to be disguised, so that nobody knows I'm Gypsy, because if coffee cup goes missing they'll say it was the Gypsy and I'll be fired.[35]

B) ACM AND THE RELATION OF ROMA WITH PROGRAMMES DESIGNED FOR THEM

Race blind policies and the lack of a deep national discussion on racism result in the absence of proper structures to deal with Roma problems. Most of the programmes and policies addressing Roma are developed or coordinated by ACM – High Commissioner for Migrations. However, one of the claims of Roma is that they are not migrants. They are in Portugal for more than 500 years and they are Portuguese citizens for a long time. Why should nationals living in Portugal for countless generations be represented by an identity that has the mission of integrating immigrants, including new Portuguese citizens and supporting non-residents Portuguese citizens?

Roma reluctance with being conflated with migrants is also related with the perpetuation of stereotypes. The label "migrants" might be confused with the notion of "itinerant" and its use ends up reproducing the idea that Roma communities live in temporary encampments and change places all the time. It turns out that the vast majority of Roma in Portugal is sedentary.

The articulation of ACM with Roma activists is not easy to address. ACM recognizes the importance of Roma participation in their projects and Roma activists do participate, but it is clear that there is many room for improvement.

> Pedro Calado [ACM] - I believe that the debate we have here today is also a moment of maturity for our democracy. Today we have people of African descent, Gypsy people who speak for themselves, who do not have intermediaries who speak for them, I believe it is a very important sign of maturity, and it is a sign that we can from now on walk eye to eye, sometimes disagreeing, we will not always agree, but life is made of that... Brazilians have a wonderful phrase, 'healthy oysters don't give pearls' ... so I think that's where we must make our way and try to find the possible consensus.
>
> [...]

---

[35] Interview 3.

Piménio Ferreira - That's why when the High Commissioner celebrated the more active participation of the Gypsies and it's true, it's a reminder that this was not a candy the State gave us, it's a conquest of ours, okay? It's because we are struggling to have that space...[36]

ACM works together with Roma associations, but activists complain that what is being done is not enough. They feel that their role is more apparent than effective and they are expected to follow the rules and approve the presented proposals.

As a rule, all associations are notified. Then it's up to them whether or not to appear. You are always free to give your opinion. However, whether this opinion will be heard or not ... because there are many meetings that are going to be a dialogue and end up being a monologue. Where people read a script, dump that information and when questioned ... they go from smiling to screaming ... or giving stupid answers, like "everybody has the right to be an idiot" [...]

When we meet with government officials, there are many smiles and many hugs, but there is much cynicism. We know that behind those smiles and those hugs nothing is going to change.[37]

This results in programs and politics that may change some numbers but don't really change lives.

So, it's becoming more and more important to have Gypsies working for Gypsies and not other larger entities that work and then come to ask for our opinion. Sometimes they come and ask us. They ask us where it hurts, but at the very end they do not treat the wound, it is ourselves treating our wounds [...]. We miss Gypsy policies. Completely. That is one of the goals for the future: Gypsy policies to be created by Gypsy men and women [...]

The policies are here, are there, they say they exist, but we don't see it. What we see is advertising, projects in the paper and we are just numbers. A we ask "what is this for?" and they don't even know what to reply. Things have no follow up [...]. I can give you an example. I was in the project "Mais Líderes" [More leaders] by the ACM.[38] We left there very frustrated. We went there about seven, eight months, we went once a week to Lisbon, but we left with empty hands [...] They taught us how to do a project, but what are we going to do with it? The bases are few, it was not an intensive course. We have to do things together, only one part cannot do everything. We have a few cases of success, I cannot be pessimistic, but I would like to see more Gypsies working together with non Gypsies, something that is not only to put in a folder and send to the European Union back with the numbers hit this year and the activities made. As long as we do not have our basic needs met, we will not make it, because only those who live there know what's going on. It is a common speech but that is real: how can I demand from a child going to school if he/she does not even have water to take a shower, has no light to study. Oh, okay, it takes will power and such. They are basic needs, anyone needs to feel safe, everyone needs to have self-esteem, because without the basic needs fulfilled that any normal person requires, I will not succeed. If I don't feel safe, if I can't give my children a safe place to live, I can't have other goals. And a lot of people do not have it [...].[39]

---

[36] Pedro Calado, High Comissioner for the Migrations, and Piménio Ferreira, TV Programme Prós e Contras (XV) "Portugal, País Racista?", 17 July 2017, episode 23.

[37] Interview 4.

[38] ACM project to empower and encourage the active participation of young Roma (http://www.acm.gov.pt/-/programa-mais-lideres-jovens-cigan-s-reunem-na-pcm).

[39] Interview 5.

According to the activists interviewed, Opré Chavalé is a very successful programme for encouraging young Gypsy women to go to university. This programme was an initiative of a Roma Association - Letras Nómadas. This organization proposed a partnership with the Portuguese Platform for Women Rights (PpDM) and the results are evaluated as positive. After being tested, this programme was transformed into a public policy and received support from ACM. Interviewed agree that the good results are explained by the origin of the Programme. It was created by Roma activists to Roma women. What was felt different was that Roma were humans and not numbers, their lives mattered and the programme was built taking into account the real conditions and not ideal ones. It didn't demand assimilation but respected the individuals and their culture and considered their conditions.

> Opré Chavalé - meaning Rise Up Young Gypsy - was completely thought out and designed in the interest of the Gypsy community's knowledge's, from Gypsy to Gypsy. Nobody helped us out in this construction. All directed so that young Gypsy can see the importance of universities in their future lives. We were able to put 33 young people in the universities. How could this be possible if it were not for the Gypsy community with its knowledge? Other entities have done so for decades and have never managed to bring Gypsy into the universities. Some believe it's not much, but it's ground-breaking. In two or three years we did what organizations for the Gypsy have not achieved in decades. We brought Gypsy girls to the university.

> Opré was a pilot project designed by two Roma people. They asked the European community for funds to do this project. The project worked so well that the state decided "this is going to be a state program." At this point it is the ACM and the Choice Program that represents this. Still, this association continues to mediate. There were very good fruits when it was design ... because we were not statistic. We were looking, " you have a problem because you have a son, you have two jobs, you have to study ... you are going to do this part-time". Now it's a program, "you do not have to go to a degree." Things change a lot because it's for statistics, it's for English people to watch.[40] Not wanting to diminish the work that has been done, one cannot see the fruit of the work of these technicians of poverty. They demand total assimilation. When you try to speak from Gypsy to Gypsy, you understand that you can integrate into society without having to assimilate, without being assimilated. You have the right to your status and ethnic identity. You don't stop being a Gypsy if you're working, studying, being in activism. Even the feminism you see doesn't fit into the Gypsy woman. That is why there are associations of empowerment of Gypsy women in which the Gypsy woman is not demeaned, remains a Gypsy woman and respects her culture and respects her own.[41]

> […] [Opré] today is a public policy, but that was born of our idea, a pilot project and today is public policy […] There is a series of programs that they have to count on us, obligatorily. Now, whether or not they like to count on us is another matter. I think many times, they don't enjoy it, but they have to deal with us and the results are there. The OPRE we are in the second year, in the first year, the success rate is 71% because those who are also working in the field are the communities.[42]

The Support fund for the Portuguese Strategy for Inclusion of Roma Communities 2013-2022 was launched in 2015 and was recently evaluated by the Centre of Studies for Social Intervention (Cesis). In 2015 this fund supported eleven projects and in 2016 this number was raised to 21. The conclusions are compatible with the

---

[40] Portuguese expression "É para inglês ver", meaning that it is only apparent, it is not a real thing.

[41] Interview to Cheila Ribeiro, 15 March 2018.

[42] Interview 2.

activists' discourses: the effective number of Roma people covered by the programme was very low and from the 28 associations that received support only 2 were Roma in 2015 and 4 in 2016 (Cardoso, 2017). Though the programme should last until 2020 its failure was recognized and is currently under revision.

c) MEDIATORS

The main task of the Roma mediators is to create bridges between Roma communities and the majority society, mediating conflicts and promoting tolerance. However, over the years, in an attempt to formalize, and professionalize the figure of the mediator, they began to be pressured to act according to employer's expectations.

> [...] the mediators in Portugal - a large part of it - those who have contracts, and there are very few, by city councils or by other entities play a Trojan horse role. And when I say Trojan is because by being paid, they have to do what employers in fact want them to do. This is not mediation, mediation goes beyond, mediation needs to be intercultural, an exempt mediator. A mediator struggles to promote dialogue between two parties. What happens is that when mediation arrived in Portugal, it came in a paternalistic way mainly for the employers and the government, who thought that the mediator was going to be the solution because, as it was being paid, it would solve the problems of entities, be they city councils, schools... and things cannot be so. The mediator builds dialogue, the mediator is not someone who is instrumentalized to do what others are afraid to do.[43]

d) THE WORKING GROUP FOR CENSUS

As we said in the third part of the report, the situation of data collection is about to change. The *Working Group Census 2021 - Ethnic-Racial Issues* was created under the coordination of High Commissioner for Migration (ACM) and the Secretariat of State for Citizenship and Equality. The composition of this group was criticized by a collective of activists in an open letter published in Portuguese newspaper of reference for the exclusion of the most interested citizens.

> In the composition of this working group, Afro-descendent or Gypsies collectives were not included. This way of doing politics is symptomatic of an understanding of democracy that puts racialized communities in the position of "beneficiaries" rather than agents of change. Certainly, we attribute to the State the responsibility and the duty to carry out the collection of data and to formulate public policies, but we do not give up the right to be involved and represented in this process in equal circumstances in the decision making. If this involvement were to take place, other strategic issues, which were so far off the agenda of the working group, would be on the table: how to broadly involve racialized individuals and the general population so that this collection is recognized and appropriated by them? How to guarantee the good use of this information by the media? How do data from the Census 2021 be combined with other sectoral surveys, first of all in the field of Justice and Education? How do you articulate this process with the proposal to launch the International Decade of Afro-descendants made last October by the Secretary of State for Citizenship and Equality, but so far with no follow-up? But, above all, what structural policies to combat racism and ethnic-racial inequalities are planned to implemented in a coordinated way with data collection? It is

---

[43] Interview 2.

not reasonable to wait for the results of data collection to finally start thinking about a policy agenda; rather, on the contrary, that agenda should drive the process of data collection.

But the point where this process is most problematic is exactly the inscription in the migrations office. On the one hand, ethnic-racial inequalities touch on several areas of political action - Education, Justice, Housing, etc. [...]. On the other hand, only those who have been very distant from the debate taking place in Portugal have not yet understood the fundamental character of the unequivocal distinction between migration policies and policies to combat racism and ethnic-racial inequalities [...].

We cannot continue to be relegated outside the body of the nation.

This is a very important topic and the presence of Roma and black activists in the discussion is crucial. The concern with what will be done with the data is also present in several activists' discourses.

What will the State do with these studies? For what? How? And what are you going to do... that's what worries me. On the one hand, it can be productive, to know that in Portugal there aren't 50,000 as they say, but there are 100,000. On the one hand, get to know their socioeconomic conditions, their educational level. From there on, the State having a focus and implementing more objective measures. This may be positive, on the other hand, it may undo some stigmas here. When they say Gypsies receive RSI. When we know it's only 3.7 that gets it. These are things that the censuses could also break down. But it is very sensitive, although we have to note and affirm that there are census ... you go to a health centre, if it is not in pencil it's hidden somewhere that it's someone that belongs, or not, to an ethnicity. You go to the police and that's clear when they say 'white guy', 'Gypsy guy'. The "census" are halfway done. Now the question is, how are you going to do it? What are you going to do with it? That's what worries me. And those questions that the Gypsy, immigrant, Afro-descendant associations are worried about ...[44]

2.4. EMPLOYMENT

The invisibility of Gypsies does not only happen in the processes of defining policies that affect them. In the daily life there are many situations in which they are obliged to silence the voice of their culture and negate their origin. As an activist puts it they have to be secret agent Gypsies.

Questions - Are you ever obliged to hide that you are Gypsy?

Yes. Work and housing! It is not easy and I went through some situations that struck me a little. That makes us want more and have the will to claim for our rights. But there is that very bad side... When we want something basic, that is to say a decent house to live with our children, at that moment, we have to hide!

I am not employed right now. I am unemployed and I am going through a mourning period, my father died. Now I can't get a job, because I am wearing this typical mourning costume. To get a job I would have to wear something else.[45]

---

[44] Interview 2.

[45] Interview 3.

We are a sum of the history of the Gypsy in this country, 500 years of persecution [...]. To be accepted in the majority society you have to be Gypsy 007, that is, you are Gypsy, but you are not Gypsy. You have to be in ethnic underground and this is very frustrating for very young people who want to get a job and cannot, or maybe can, but when they find out they are of Gypsy ethnicity they're fired. Although we live in a very cynical country, because the laws say that we cannot discriminate by skin tone or ethnic condition and this is not what happens. There are many company good-practice guides that have it in black and white, but then what you go through when you receive training, "do not approach Gypsies", "we do not want Gypsies" [...].

I am one of the 007 Gypsies. Within the Opré group there are more 007 Gypsies who are working and to subsist they have to work in ethnic clandestinity. It's frustrating. It's frustrating when you want to stand up for your people, when you're empowering yourself to stand up for your people, to claim your rights, to empower young Gypsy children and then you can't because then you're out of work.[46]

2.5. EDUCATION

The question of education is crucial as the low rates of formal education contribute to the reproduction of exclusion. Several programs have been put in action, namely the mentioned Opré Chavalé, a project designed to help Gypsy women go to university. There is a lot to do but that work cannot be done only with Roma population. Formal education experiences may be violent in several ways and the reality must be taken into account.

A) CURRICULA AND SCHOOL BOOKS

School is a very efficient way to define what is normal and what is not, what is relevant and what is not and what exists and doesn't. Education defines a pattern to society that excludes the narratives and the history of the Roma and of other groups. Portugal continues to be presented as a homogeneous country with a great history of world discoveries. Roma are dispossessed of relevant knowledge and their voice is absolutely silenced.

Society, as it is established, defines almost a kind of standardization of what is the average citizen, the acceptable citizen and those who are not. Those who follow the standard rules, which fit into what is predictable, are those that achieve a more successful schooling.[47]

We have a lot of tools to offer. They talk about school absenteeism in the Gypsy community [...]. We've been here 500 years! 500 years is the history of a country! Why didn't they mention the Gypsy community in Portuguese history? How do I see myself in the history of a country as a Gypsy student if they don't even mention my culture, my arrival in Portugal, why I came here, how I came here and what I did afterwards, including all the persecutions that my people suffered? I go to a white school to learn white people things: they are superior, they won battles, they discovered everything. They leave out that they took Gypsy to colonize Brazil. They'd go to Angola, because their skin tone was suited for the weather [...]. The change of mentalities has much to be worked. If I only change the culture of my community, it won't do. I have to change yours too, because a bridge has two banks. If one is balanced and the other

---

[46] Interview 4.

[47] Olga Mariano quoted in a reportage by Frianças and Botelho (2018).

only has shifting sands, the bridge goes down. It has to be a solid, joint change. We have to move forward at the same time. But "they have to change! Gypsies have to change." That's no good.[48]

The history taught in schools is so unique that we think that the Portuguese are the heroes of the world, when in fact the Portuguese were colonizing, were killing [...] When I take my children to school I know that I am taking them for something that's not true. I know that I take my children to a school where they have to blindly follow, otherwise they're screwed [...]. I know school is important. Maintaining identity, but with academic training is the way out for the Gypsy at this moment. I have to actively participate in my children's schooling because at school or we're not mentioned or if the Gypsies are mentioned, they're tricksters.[49]

When the state, which has to defend the people, does not accept to defend this ethnic minority and kind of tells us 'deal with it' this could be changed if our children in school had "Citizenship and Equality". They have music, they have English, but they do not have "Citizenship" and at home they also don't have it, because the parents also didn't have it. There is citizenship to your economic class, there is citizenship to your social class, but there is no citizenship to the poor. In the minds of many folk people are poor because they don't want to work [...]. It's a social problem, it's a problem of society and it is up to the State to change it. This would change with new manuals, with history of Portugal, with the true History of Portugal – don't romanticize the History of Portugal. We got there, we maimed, raped and include the Gypsy in those books, we've been here for 500 years. They still tell me "go back where you came from" and I ask, where do I come from? I was born in Gala![50]

B) "007" STUDENTS

The same way adults might have to hide they are Roma to get and keep a job, parents are sometimes encouraged by teachers and school staff to hide the ethnic origin of their children. This situation strongly varies according to the geographical area.

I may not have any official figures, but I have a fairly large number of children who are four children and who have effectively been discriminated against at school for being Gypsies, including they often oblige me to change them from school because the school itself thought they had to hide that they were Gypsies.[51]

2.6. HOUSING

The Portuguese Constitution provides in the article 65 that "everyone has the right, for himself and for his family, to a habitation of adequate size, in conditions of hygiene and comfort (…)". Unfortunately, this isn't the reality for the great majority of the Roma community in Portugal, which continues to live without the minimum conditions of habitability, health and hygiene, accentuating their situation of social exclusion. The neighborhoods

---

[48] Interview 3.

[49] Interview 1.

[50] Interview 4.

[51] Maria Gil, TV Programme Prós e Contras (XV) "Portugal, País Racista?", 17 July 2017, episode 23

where Roma communities live are often located near dumps and polluted industrial sites on the periphery of the cities. This situation deepens the distance between Roma and the majority society and makes it more difficult to escape the precariousness and social and economic exclusion.

A recent situation illustrates the problems and violence experienced by Roma communities. On March 3th, as a result of a tornado that hit the city of Faro (Algarve, Portugal), about 100 people from the Roma community had to leave their houses. The damages caused in the camp inhibited the community to return the place, due to damages in the precarious structures where they resided, constructed with woods and tiles.[52]

The temporary solution found by the local authority was to house the inhabitants of the camp in the Municipal Pavilion of Faro. In a meeting with the Secretary of State for Housing, the mayor of Faro assured that the municipality would help in the reconstruction of the shacks affected by the tornado. In the letter subscribed by Roma Associations, the words were of indignation for the "ease of alternatives proposed by the municipality, which go through the donation, once again, of wood to rebuild the tents".[53]

The President of the Republic, Marcelo Rebelo de Sousa, also visited the pavilion asking for "patience while waiting for new houses, although there may be an intermediate solution".[54] However, Roma activists point out that the visit passed very discreetly in most of the media – which hasn't happened in other visits of the President. For them, this constitutes a clear sign of the prejudices in the society as it results from the fear of contradicting public opinion surrounding the Portuguese Roma.

On March 14th, some associations met with the Secretary of State for Housing. The meeting was attended by 5 Roma associations from various parts of the country. Bruno Gonçalves, a Roma activist, told to the newspaper 'Público': "we are happy for her honesty, for the clarity with which she explained the possibilities". According to the Secretary of State, two programs are to be implemented, one of which has already been approved and is specific for emergency situations, seeking to create emergency accommodation for people deprived of housing due to catastrophe or migratory movements. The second program, still in discussion, seeks to solve the problem of people who "have nowhere to live" or live in habitations considered unworthy.[55]

Although state measures are starting to emerge, there aren't specific measures for the Roma population. Roma activists are relieved that the answer for the problem in Faro wasn't the creation of "nomadic parks or housing integration centres" as these solutions promote the segregation and ghettoization of communities, perpetuating the stereotype. The representative of Roma Associations presents in the meeting pointed some problems that need to be circumvented first. One of them is the indignation of many citizens - made very explicit in the social media – with the public support to Roma. In a society that refuses to recognize structural racism, many people are against measures to support Roma's, accusing these communities of being state dependents.

This case of Faro is only an example of the huge housing problems faced by Portuguese Roma. There is a clear gap between public policies and the reality.

---

[52]   http://expresso.sapo.pt/sociedade/2018-03-04-Tornado-em-Faro-desaloja-cem-pessoas-de-uma-comunidade-cigana#gs.TlK1fOI

[53]   (https://www.publico.pt/2018/03/07/local/noticia/marcelo-visita-sabado-as-familias-ciganas-desalojadas-em-faro-1805666)

[54] http://www.sulinformacao.pt/2018/03/comunidade-cigana-do-cerro-do-bruxo-regressou-ao-seu-acampamento/

[55]   https://www.publico.pt/2018/03/14/sociedade/noticia/associacoes-de-ciganos-querem-ajudar-a-evitar-a-segregacao-1806689

When Roma citizens want to access the formal housing market, they face many obstacles. In some cases, condominium rules include "no owner can sell the house to a Roma".[56] Many Roma are obliged to hide their ethnicity until the contract is signed and even with a signed contract it happens to be refused. These situations go unpunished despite their anti-constitutional character.

> We, persecuted people since we arrived in Portugal, five hundred years ago, still continue today to feel this persecution, especially in the case of housing. When we want to buy a house, when we want to rent a house in urban environments - if it's in the projects, there is no problem, "let them be there, the further away from the urban network, the better, preferably with only one way in and one way out, so if something ever happens, they all just stay there"- [...] Nobody rents to them, because they're Gypsies. Nobody sells to them because they're Gypsies. There are even clauses in condominiums - this is completely unconstitutional - that those who buy cannot sell to either Gypsies or blacks.[57]

3. ASSOCIATIONS/ORGANIZATIONS/ACTIVISM

3.1. CLASSIC ASSOCIATIONS

There are several Roma associations that follow the NGO model. Though they are frequently the interlocutors of ACM, they have no strong presence in the definition of programs and policies.

List of national Roma associations:

- *Letras Nómadas* | Nomadic Lyrics
- *Associação dos Mediadores Ciganos de Portugal (AMEC)* | Association of Gypsy Mediators of Portugal
- *Associação para o Desenvolvimento das Mulheres Ciganas Portuguesas (AMUCIP)* | Association for the Development of Portuguese Gypsy Women
- *Associação Portuguesa para o Desenvolvimento da Etnia Cigana (APODEC)* | Portuguese Association for the Development of the Roma
- *Gypsy Produções – Associação Cultural (GPAC)* | Gypsy Produções – Cultural Association,
- *Associação para a Igualdade de Género nas Comunidades Ciganas (RIBALTAMBIÇÃO)* | Association to the gender equality of Gypsy Women
- *Sílaba Dinâmica – Associação Intercultural* / Dynamic Silab – Intercutural Association

3.2. SOCIAL MEDIA NETWORKS

Social media are not only the place of hate discourses. Alongside classic associations an emergent group born from the social media is creating national links between activists and non-activists, classic associations and independent activists, Roma communities and the majority society. They claim for their voices to be heard, denunciate forms of discrimination and show the proud for their Roma origin. Social media facilitates and makes public the links between different groups, namely anti-racist organizations and feminist organizations.

---

[56] https://24.sapo.pt/atualidade/artigos/as-mulheres-ciganas-existem-e-resistem

[57] Interview to Olga Mariano, 12 March 2018.

The Facebook page *Gypsy Initiative - This time is not a carnation, it is a beer* (Iniciativa Cigana - Desta vez não é um cravo, é uma cerveja) (https://www.facebook.com/Destaveznaoeumcravoeumacerveja/) started by exposing anti-Roma discrimination in a bar: beer was being sold to the Roma community for more than twice the price (€1,2 non Roma; €3,00 Roma). On the Facebook page presentation, we can read:

> Finally, things are changing. A group of young Gypsy living in Moura decided to say ENOUGH! to this situation and, even knowing the difficulties they may face, decided to take action against this cowardly act of discrimination, denouncing and proving it, which in itself was a revolution.

> Gypsy people thus prove that they will no longer be discriminated against, that they are better informed about their rights and that they want to participate in the struggle against discrimination.

> From now on, it is certain that they will no longer be calm and with no reaction in face of acts of discrimination. It is more than time to get out of the lethargy that has allowed the maintenance of prejudiced ideologies and discriminatory acts in society and do something!

Social media facilitates the participation of men and women that are no fully identified with any of the classic organizations. They can be part of discussions, mobilize and be mobilized to concrete actions, dialogue with Roma and non-Roma organizations.

> I'm a Freestyle activist. I have never had a written link to anything static [...]. I'm a nomad, I'm a Gypsy [laughs]. It is one thing to know what my principle is, but it is a basis, to which I can attribute variants. We cannot believe that the earth is flat and square.

> Social networks were the great engine of our convergence and our discussion. Social networks have their drawbacks, but there is no black without white. Social networks brought activists together [...].

> I'm a Facebook activist [laughs] [...].

3.3. "WOMEN AND GYPSY. WE EXIST AND WE RESIST"

Being Roma and a woman means to face racist and sexist discriminations. The interviewed women dialogue with the feminist movement and there seems to exist some bridges between Roma women and feminist organizations. However, Roma women don't fully identify with feminist associations. They are not a homogeneous group, have different experiences and relate differently with the Roma community and with the majority society. The interviewed activists represent a part of this diversity, but all of them claim they must simultaneously struggle against sexism and for the recognition of their Roma identity and voice.

As we saw there are a few classic organizations whose mission is to empower Roma women. Alongside a group of women is creating a network to discuss specific questions of being a Gypsy and woman: "Women and Gypsy. We exist and we resist". This network brings together Roma women with different experiences that are active and have ideas but are not formally connected with any association.

> There is a phrase that I used in a demonstration [see the image below]. We are women and Gypsy, we exist and we resist. Woman and Gypsy. I add the "and" and it's important. I add to my culture the fact that I'm a woman. What strikes me the most is having to say "we exist", to remember that, as women, we exist. And we resist. The "and" is essential [...]. Being a woman

and Gypsy means that we exist, that we have a right to this existence and that we have the possibility to choose [...].[58]

When I go to an activity with Gypsy I always wear pants. I call it the uniform. Because that's how I work the alongside non-Gypsy, who see the stereotype of the black skirt undone, that still exists, but in certain situations and communities. But I am me. In the plural there is a singular. I am Gypsy a plural, but I am Maria, a singular. So I work both sides, undo the stereotype that we only dress in a certain way and the Gypsy side to say I do what I want, I go where I want and it is possible to go where I want and continue to be Gypsy. Although there are very disagreeing voices, there are many Gypsy that admire me and I am well received, I am respected, but they put "in spite of ..." [...]. This "despite" hurts a lot, when you have a 20 year old girl, an activist like you, pathing the way for some demystification, but enjoying the rear-guard of the associations, which gave her the possibility of studying and being placed in a spot that pleases Greek and Trojans. I do not please Greeks and Trojans.[59]

The weight of tradition is with us, but you suffer, you are discriminated for being a woman, both by the majority society and by the Gypsy society. [A friend] says, "I'm twice screwed. I'm a woman and a Gypsy", we use that a lot. We are discriminated because there are antibodies in the majority society, against women and against Gypsies, and as for Gypsy women woopty-woop.[60]

---

[58] Interview to Maria Gil, 11 February 201

[59] Interview to Maria Gil, 11 February 2018.

[60] Interview to Cheila Ribeiro, 15 March 2018.

IMAGE 1 - MARIA GIL, "WOMEN AND GYPSY. EXIST AND RESIST"

CONCLUSION

The non-recognition of institutional racism results in the absence of adequate measures to address the foundational inequalities and to balance opportunities. Race blind universal measures are not enough. Though fundamental rights were allegedly universalized to the Portuguese population, Roma communities remained a second class group of citizens. For them, access to education, health, housing and employment was never a certainty. The economic problems that brought an enormous number of Portuguese citizens to the streets after the intervention of Troika were old concerns for Roma Communities.

The presumed homogeneity of the nation-state and blind laws based on the ideas of equality and universality are not enough. Portugal has no data that allows for a deep evaluation of structural racism and sub-representation of certain voices. These create barriers for minority groups to claim their rights and open space for a general denial of a huge problem of the society. In debates, minority groups must always be in a position of reaction, replying to representatives of the majority who define the terms of debate about minorities and what is racism or sub-representation and what is not. Things are changing, but as Piménio Ferreira pointed out in a debate with the High Commissionaire for Migrations, this results from the struggle of activists, it was not something given as an inalienable right. This means that the country must find regular structures to ensure that policies and programmes include the country diversity.

In the introduction we mentioned the three circles of civil society identified by Sousa Santos (2002), a representation of how different groups have different access to the state. More recently, the analytical proposition of Boaventura de Sousa Santos (2014) come to identify an abyssal line that separates the strange civil society from the uncivil civil society. Those who are on the other side of the line, in the uncivil civil society,

are not only excluded but also depicted as subhuman, not applicable to social inclusion. The other side of the line is what Franz Fanon called the zone of none being (Fanon, 2008 [1952]). By denying humanity, practices that do not fit in the theories can evade calling these theories into question, and likewise inhuman practices do not call into question the principles of humanity. Roma, along with other groups in Europe, belong to that other side whose knowledge and experiences are always local, ignorant, irrelevant, primitive, unproductive (Santos, 2006, 2007, 2014). The Fanoninan idea of Roma as living in the sub humanity zone is reflected through the report and is clearly illustrated in a single sentence a young Roma women activist:

> Then there are wonderful things, we have parties concerned with the green, with the animals, but there is no party that takes a political attitude "I am worried about the Gypsy".

The construction of Europe spawns from a hegemonic interpretation of diversity, more heavily based on tolerating the 'other' than on constructing horizontal dialogues that include all the different voices. Inequalities among citizens are not the only consequence. An enormous waste of European social experience results from the processes of making alternatives invisible or non-credible. Roma communities are not expected to speak for themselves, but to be explained by the owners of knowledge and power. Other people produces policy documents to address their problems. Good will is many times paternalist and does not change the big picture of a racist and colonial world were some groups are allowed to stay but are not considered part of it. Integration tends to signify assimilation or tolerance and never real recognition. This blocks the possibilities of Roma and other minorities to define racism in their own terms and producing awareness of the structural racism. In this context solutions and politics are mainly cosmetic.

We are not proposing tolerance with the other or conservative multiculturalism that accepts difference but refuses to learn from them. We are talking about converting vertical differences into horizontal differences; (re-)learning each other's history and recognizing all of them as part of the country history; recognizing past oppressions and current continuities of that past; allowing different groups to speak for themselves and encourage people to active listen to each other and learn. The absence of real contact with different ways of thinking and knowledges leads to misunderstandings, to the fallacy that one's own culture is superior, and to the approval of laws and rules that do not fit into the reality of various groups and lead to unacceptable structural inequality (Meneses, Araújo & Brito, 2018).

When we erase from the public sphere some groups, we are not only weakening those groups, but losing an opportunity of growing through processes of reciprocal learning (Santos, 2014). Roma are constantly being represented as a group apart from the nationals, that although having the same rights, needs some majority national to speak for them. As long as their needs, choices, opinions and proposals are spoken out by others than them, Portuguese Roma cannot achieve political representation and Portuguese society is failing as a democracy.

We propose to do research "with" Roma and design politics "with" Roma instead of research "about" and policies "about". In science and in politics we must test and use devices and methodologies more inclusive, open to different voices where minorities can speak for themselves and be heard. Considering this case, we suggest to do in Portugal a workshop of the Popular University of Social Movements that (UPMS) (Santos, 2006). The UPMS is not a conventional popular university but a device that combines knowledge born from social struggles and knowledge emerging from committed academic work. Coming to existence in 2003 in the context of the World Social Forum, it is a collective asset based on three central concepts the Epistemologies of the South: ecology of knowledges, reciprocal learning and intercultural translation. The ecology of knowledges is an epistemological instrument used against the waste of experience. It intends to replace the monoculture of the scientific knowledge by the recognition of the diversity of knowledge that exists in the world, namely in the Global South. In the UPMS it refers to a merger and reciprocal enrichment of academic theory and social movements practice. The concept of co-learning seeks to bridge the traditional gap between teaching and learning and create horizontality between academic and activists and between different struggles. Intercultural translation aims to increase the necessary mutual understanding among movements, organizations and researchers without

affecting the autonomy of each of them. The starting point of UPMS is the recognition of mutual ignorance and its end point is the shared production of innovative knowledge. It is led into operation by holding workshops, preferably lasting two days which run on a residential basis in which discussion periods alternate with time dedicated to study and reflection, and leisure activities (Santos, 2006, 2014).

Horizontal dialogues are decolonized dialogues that work on the basis of an ecology of knowledges. Ecology of knowledges is different from relativism. Defending it is not saying that every knowledge matters in the same way and for the same circumstances. It means the process of bringing together scientific knowledge and knowledge raised in social struggles without discrediting any part. Condescending posture must be out of this. Every part must present and discuss its own ideas.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abreu, Alexandre; Mendes, Hugo; Rodrigues, João; Gusmão, José Guilherme; Serra, Nuno; Teles, Nuno; Alves, Pedro Delgado; Mamede, Ricardo Pais (2013), *A Crise da Troika e as Alternativas Urgentes*. Lisboa: Tinta da China

ACIDI (2013), *Estratégia Nacional para a Integração das Comunidades Ciganas 2013-2020*. Available at http://www.acm.gov.pt/documents/10181/52642/enicc_ACM.pdf/42f8ef57-8cd7-4118-9170-9fcd9bc53ec2.

ACM (2018), *3.09 - Projeto de mediadores municipais e interculturais*. Aviso n.º POISE- 33-2018-06. Available at: HTTP://POISE.PORtugal2020.pt/documents/10180/74906/ACC_3+09_Mediadores+Municipais+Intercult urais_20180409_VF.pdf/d7ecab0a-2a7c-4a02-908d-be1fea357352.

Betancourt, Joseph R. *et al* (2003), "Defining Cultural Competence: a practical framework for addressing racial/ethnic disparities in health and health care", *Public Health Reports*, 118.

Brito, Laura (2016), *Competência cultural em saúde: caso específico da relação dos profissionais de saúde com a comunidade cigana*. Dissertação em Antropologia Médica para atribuição de grau de Mestre. FCT-Universidade de Coimbra.

Cardoso, Ana (coord.) (2017), *Estudo de Avaliação da Implementação do Fundo de Apoio à Estratégia Nacional para a Integração das Comunidades Ciganas (FAPE) 2015 e 2016*. CESIS.

Casa-Nova, Maria José (2008), *Etnografia e produção de conhecimento. Reflexões críticas a partir de uma investigação com Ciganos*. Lisboa: ACIDI- Alto Comissariado para a Imigração e o Diálogo Intercultural.

Castro, Alexandra; Santos, Marta Santos; Knapic, Sofia (2010), *Projeto Mediadores Municipais – Relatório Final de Avaliação.* CET, INSCTE-IUL

Castro-Gómez, Santiago (2007), "Decolonizar la universidad. La hybris del punto cero y diálogo de saberes". *In* Castro-Gómez, Santiago & Grosfoguel, Ramón (org.), *El giro decolonial. Reflexiones para una diversidad epistémica más allá del capitalismo global*. Bogotá: Siglo del Hombre Editores, Universidad Central-Instituto de Estudios Sociales Contemporáneos y Pontificia Universidad Javeriana-Instituto Pensar.

Comissão Parlamentar de Ética, Sociedade e cultura (2009), *Relatório das audições efetuadas sobre Portugueses Ciganos no âmbito do Ano Europeu para o Diálogo Intercultural*.

Council of Europe (2004), *Report Submitted by Portugal Pursuant to Article 25, Paragraph 1 of the Framework Convention for the protection of National Minorities* (received on 23 December; ACFC/SR(2004)002).

DGEEC (2018), Perfil Escolar da Comunidade Cigana, 2016/17.

ERRC and Númena (2007), *Social Inclusion Through Social Services: The Case of Roma and Travellers. Accessing the Impact of National Plans for Social Inclusion in Czech Republic*. Available at: http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/media/02/23/m00000223.pdf

Fanon, Frantz (2008 [1952]), *Black Skin. White Masks*. New York: Grove Press.

FRA (2018). *A persisting concern: anty-Gypsyism as a barrier to Roma inclusion.* European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights. Luxembourg: Publication Office of the European Union, 2018

Fundacíon Secretariado Gitano (2007), *Guia para a intervenção com a comunidade cigana nos serviços de saúde. A.D.I.*

Henriques, Joana Gorjão (2011)), *Portugal is race blind, but not for the right reasons.* The Guardian. Available at: . – artigo do the guardian https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2011/sep/12/portugal-race

Henriques, Joana Gorjão (2018), *Racismo no País dos Brancos Costumes*. Lisboa: Tinta da China

Hermes, Augusto Costa; Dias, Hugo; Soeiro, José (2015), "Strikes and Austerity in Portugal: Perspectives, Expression and Recomposition", *RCCS Annual Review*, 7, 45-73

Maeso, Sílvia and Araújo, Marta (2011), "'Civilising' the Roma/Gypsies. Public policies, 'employability' and the depoliticisation of (anti-)racism in Portugal", Working Paper, TOLERACE project. Coimbra: CES. Available at: http://www.ces.uc.pt/projectos/tolerace/media/WP3/WorkingPapers%203_Portugal.pdf

Magano, Olga; Mendes, Maria Manuela (2013), *Ciganos Portugueses: olhares cruzados e interdisciplinares em torno de políticas sociais em projetos de intervenção social e cultural*. CEMRI-Lisboa

Magano, Olga; Mendes, Maria Manuela (2014), "Ciganos e políticas sociais em Portugal", *Sociologia, Revista da Faculdade de Letras da Universidade do Porto*, Número temático - Ciganos na Península Ibérica e Brasil: estudos e políticas sociais, 15-35.

Malheiros, Jorge (2002), "Portugal Seeks Balance of Emigration, Immigration", *Migration Policy Institute*, 1 December. Available at http://www.migrationpolicy.org/article/portugal-seeks-balance-emigration-immigration

Martins, Ana Maria Guerra (2017), *Country report Non-discrimination Portugal*. Brussels: European Commission

Mendes, Maria Manuela; Magano, Olga; Candeias, Pedro (2014), *Estudo Nacional Sobre as Comunidades Ciganas*. Lisboa: ACM

Mendes, Maria Manuela; Magano, Olga; Candeias, Pedro (2016), "Social and spatial continuities and differentiations among Portuguese Ciganos: regional profiles", *Sociologia*, 61 (LXI), 1, 5-36.

Meneses, Maria Paula; Araújo, Sara; Brito, Laura (2018), "21st May – World Day for Cultural Diversity for Dialogue and Development", *ETHOS - Towards a European Theory of Justice and Fairness, creating a new integrative perspective on justice and fairness*, blog entry. Available at https://ethosjustice.wordpress.com/2018/05/21/21st-may-world-day-for-cultural-diversity-for-dialogue-and-development/

Mignolo, Walter D. (2003b), "Os esplendores e as misérias da "ciência": colonialidade, geopolítica do conhecimento e pluri-versalidade epistémica". *In* Santos, Boaventura de Sousa (org.), *Conhecimento Prudente para uma Vida Decente. Um discurso sobre as ciências reinventado*. Porto: Afrontamento.

Neto, Maria da Conceição (1997), "Ideologias, contradições e mistificações da colonização de Angola no século XX", *Lusotopie*, 327-359

Nicolau, Lurdes Fernandes (2016), "Complexidades no percurso escolar das crianças ciganas: relatos de pais e professores". *Configurações*, 18.

Númena (2008), *O Racismo e Xenofobia em Portugal (2001-2007)*. Oeiras: Númena. Available at: http://www.amnistia-internacional.pt/files/Estudo_Racismo_Portugal.pdf

Santos, Boaventura de Sousa (2002), *Towards a New Legal Common Sense.* London: Butterwords.

Santos, Boaventura de Sousa (2012), *Portugal. Ensaio contra a auto-flagelação.* Coimbra: Almedina

Santos, Boaventura de Sousa (2014), *Epistemologies of the South*. *Justice against epistemicide*. London: Paradigm Publishers

Santos, Fernando (2016), *Evaluation of the Council of Europe and European Union Joint Programme 'ROMED' – National Conclusion, Portugal.*

Silva, L.F. *et al* (2000), *"*A Comunidade Cigana e o Etnocentrismo da Instituição Médica de saúde comunitária*",* IV Congresso Português de Sociologia, Coimbra

Appendix – Documents/policies/programmes

General laws

Type of document	Date	Tittle	Minority	Notes
Constitution	1976	Constitution of Portuguese Republic		Declares equality, imposes universality of rights, does not specific measures for specific groups. *"No one shall be privileged, favoured, prejudiced, deprived of any rights or exempted from any duty on the basis of ancestry, sex, race, language, place of origin, religion, political or ideological beliefs, education, economic situation, social circumstances or sexual orientation"* (CPR, article 13)
Law		Criminal Code		"Penal Code, Article 240 states that those who establish or set up an organisation, or develop organised propaganda activities which incite discrimination, hatred or violence against a person or a group of persons on grounds of their race, or take part in such an organisation or in its activities or give support thereto, shall be punished by imprisonment for 1 to 8 year" "Article 246 of the Criminal Code, any person convicted for the offences established in Article 240 may be temporarily deprived of his/her active and/or passive electoral capacity" (https://rm.coe.int/1680304ff9).

High Commissioner for Migrations

Type of document	Date	Title	Minority	Notes
Decree-Law	1996	Creates the High Commissioner for Immigration and Ethnic Minorities ACIME [Decree-Law 3-A/96, de 26 de Janeiro	Immigrants and ethnic minorities in general	
Decree-Law	2002	Revocation of the Decree-Law nº3-A/96, of 26 January and the Decree-Law nº39/98	Ethnic minorities	Enlargement of the Commissioner into a broader body, with more resources and a larger scope of action
Decree-Law	2007	ACIME is replaced by the High Commissioner for Immigration and Intercultural Dialogue (ACIDI) Decree-Law nº167/2007, of 3 May 2007)		The concept of "ethnic minorities" is replaced by "intercultural dialogue"
Decree-Law	2014	High Commissioner for the Migration (ACM) http://www.acm.gov.pt Decree-Law nº31/2014, of 27 February Creation of the ObCig – Roma Communities Observatory		The expression "Intercultural dialogue" disappears. According to the legislative decree, this change was made to adapt the ACIDI organic to a modern migratory policy. It gradually lost the focus on the ethnic groups and of the management of ethnic cultural diversity (Magano & Mendes, 2014) "The objective of the ObCig is to gather and make available studies and other existing publications related to the subject of Roma communities; ; promote the publication of studies aimed at improving existing knowledge on the subject of Roma communities; promote and disseminate initiatives or events, such as seminars or colloquia, that promote greater awareness of the situation of Roma communities and/or allow the formation of key actors in this area. Disseminate their activity and the gathered knowledge, through diverse supports, with a view to the wide availability of information. Promote cooperation and articulation between ACM and scientific and academic institutions, nationally and internationally. Sensitizing and

				deconstructing myths, representations and/or stereotypes about Gypsy communities.

Reports submitted by Portugal – FCNM (Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities)

In 2002, the FCNM enters into force in Portugal[61]

Cycle	Type of document	Date	Title	Minority	Notes and highlights
First Cycle	State report	1st report: 1 September 2003 1st report received on 23 December 2004	Report submitted by Portugal Pursuant to Article 25, paragraph 1 of the framework convention for the protection of national minorities (ACF/SR/(2004)002 http://rm.coe.int/168008b12e	National minorities	"The Portuguese Republic has no policy in 'national minorities' because the concept of such minorities its unknown in its legal system. Of course, public international law, in its current state, embraces no universally recognized of the 'nation' concept or of its corollary, the 'national minority' concept; nor does the framework convention itself attempt any such definition. This may be explained by the fact that the States Parties to the Framework Convention use widely diverging interpretations off these concepts, in line with their widely diverging political and legal traditions". "the Constitution of the Portuguese Republic nowhere refers to the existence of political minorities ("national minorities"), or even social ones; however, several laws do refer to de facto social minorities such as ethnic ones (there is a High Commissioner responsible for promoting the integration of immigrants and ethnic minorities into the national community) or religious minorities (given the dominant status, in social rather than legal terms, of the Roman Catholic Church, the law sets out certain safeguards for minority religious denominations, for instance in terms of access to the media). Moreover, since civil society is organized independently on the basis of exercise of the fundamental right of association, all kinds of minority groups enjoy freedom of expression, within the limits established by law. Nevertheless, the Portuguese constitutional system does not divide up the body politics in terms of the citizens' various origins and options, which are expressed in social terms and some of which enjoy legal recognition, but which are not deemed politically decisive. One example of the consequences of this principle is the explicit constitutional prohibition of political parties based on religion – which is manifestly in keeping with the exercise of religious freedom, a principle which is obviously respected in Portugal. As the Explanatory Report to the Framework Convention so aptly puts it, the mere existence of objective differences which create de facto social minorities does not necessarily

---

[61] (1995 – Council of Europe: Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (European Treaty Series – No 157)).

					lead to the creation of "national minorities" – and the Portuguese authorities consider that such de facto minorities do not fall within the scope of the Framework Convention

"Despite its highly heterogeneous ethnic origins, which stem from the multiple migration flows into Portugal over the centuries, the Portuguese population shows enormous cultural homogeneity, particularly in terms of language. In this connection, apart from Portuguese and the languages used by the more recent immigrants, the country's only dialect is "Miranda's", which is spoken by several hundred persons in the Miranda do Douro region in the north-east of the country". |
| | Opinion | Date of adoption : 6 October 2006; Date of publicati on: 5 Septemb er 2007 | Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention For the Protection of National Minorities – Opinion on Portugal | National Minorities | "although the State Report states that there are no national minorities in Portugal the position expressed by the authorities with regard to the scope of application of the Framework Convention has evolved in the course of their dialogue with the advisory committee and, in particular, the relevance of Article 6 of the Framework Convention has been recognized. The authorities are encouraged to take further steps in this respect, including engaging in consultations on the Framework Convention with the groups considered ethnic minorities by the authorities. The Advisory Committee welcomes the authorities' effort to adopt legislative, institutional and practical measures to combat discrimination and racism. Integration policy, coupled with the promotion of multicultural education, has also remained high on the agenda. Moreover, measures have been taken to improve the socio-economic an educational situation of the Roma. However, a large number of Roma are still at a disadvantage in this respect. They are also often confronted with discrimination, social exclusion and marginalization. Further measures should be developed, in co-operation with the persons concerned, to promote the full and effective equality of the Roma, in particular in the fields of housing, education, employment and health and to continue to combat prejudice and hostility against them".

"that attitudes of rejection and hostility towards minorities are present in the Portuguese society, especially based on the colour of the skin and towards Roma; it further finds that racist movements are increasingly active, although reported racially-motivated violence and crime remain rare. The advisory committee also finds that lack of data on racially motivated crime hinders proper monitoring of this problem. Consequently, the Advisory Committee considers that the authorities should further develop and strengthen programs aiming at countering prejudices against persons belonging to ethnic minorities and should put mechanisms in place to ensure the proper recording and data collection on racially motivated violence and crime and to ensure that these crimes are thoroughly investigated". |

	Government comments	Date of receipt: 1 March 2007	Comments of the Government of Portugal on the first opinion of the advisory committee on the implementation of the FCNM by Portugal	National Minorities	"Portugal does not recognize the existence of national minorities in its territory, recognizing only one ethnic minority, the Roma community. A different matter is that Portugal has become a destiny country for immigration, which addresses different concerns than those of the protection of national minorities mentioned in the Convention. In fact, and as shown by the results of Eurobarometer's December report, Portugal is the second member of the European Union (following Sweden), whose citizen's most defend that immigrants are an important contribution to the country. We would also have to disagree with paragraph 62, which states that attitudes of rejection and hostility towards minorities are present in the Portuguese society, for this does not accurately reflect the rule in the Portuguese society. We would also like to reinforce that Portugal has in its legal frame several mechanisms to fight and punish practices or racial and ethnic discrimination in defense of any citizen that might be a victim of those practices, instead of a protection given to one national minority [...]".
	Resolution	Date of adoption : 5 September 2007	Resolution CM/ResCMN (2007)12 on the implementation of the FCNM by Portugal	National Minorities	Adopts the following conclusions concerning the implementation of the FCNM by Portugal: • although the state report states that there are no national minorities in Portugal, the position expressed by the authorities with regard to the scope of application of the Framework Convention has evolved and, in particular, the relevance of Article 6 of the Framework Convention has been recognized. The authorities are encouraged to take further steps in this respect, including engaging in consultations on the Framework Convention with the groups considered ethnic minorities by the authorities • efforts have been made by the authorities to adopt legislative, institutional and practical measures to combat discrimination and racism. Integration policy, coupled with the promotion of multicultural education, has also remained high on the agenda. Moreover, measures have been taken to improve the socio-economic and educational situation of the Roma. However, a number of Roma are still at a disadvantage in this respect and they could be confronted with discrimination, social exclusion and marginalization • further measures should be developed, in co-operation with the persons concerned, to promote the full and effective equality of the Roma, in particular in the fields of housing, education, employment and health and to continue to combat prejudice and hostility against them

Secon d Cycle	State Report	2nd report due on 1 Septemb er 2008; 2nd report received on 14 January 2009	Second report submitted by Portugal pursuant to article 25, paragraph 1 of the FCNM FOR THE Protection of National Minorities ACFC/SR/II(2 009)001	National Minorities	"1. This report has been drafted in the context of a continuation of the national position on the non-recognition of the existence of national minorities in Portugal. Portugal has recognized the existence of one ethnic minority in the country, namely the Roma community; however, this reflects quite a different situation from what is meant by "national minority" in the Framework Convention. In this sense and on this basis, specific answers are given to the questions put by the Advisory Committee and certain relevant aspects in this regard are presented. We would like to stress that this fact of recognizing the Roma community is not incompatible with the non-recognition of national minorities in Portugal, and our position is that the Framework Convention does not apply to recent immigration issues" "It is important to outline the structure by the Prime Minister's Office, which reorganized the former Office of the High Commissioner for Immigration and Ethnic Minorities, immigrants' integration policies were merge with the intercultural dialogue dimension, expressly stated in the terms of reference of the current Office of the High Commissioner for Immigration and Intercultural Dialogue (ACIDI, IP). This state institution, which also includes the responsibilities of other bodies since abolished, including the "Entreculturas" office and the Task Force for Dialogue with Religious Communities, has been given additional responsibilities and a role to play in the field of intercultural dialogue. The current role of the ACIDI [...] is to contribute to the framing and evaluation of public policies, both cross-cutting and sector-specific, of relevance to the integration of immigrants and ethnic minorities, and to promote dialogue between various cultures, ethnic groups and religions, in full compliance with the Constitution and legislation, and enhancing cultural diversity in a context of mutual respect". The only figures we have on the Roma Community are based on estimates (it is thought that they number approximately 40-50 000 people in Portugal), and we are therefore unable to provide statistics on the actual number because of the provisions of Directive 96/46/EC of the European Parliament and the Council, transposed into the national legislation by Law no.67/98, of 26 October which, in general terms, prohibits the processing of personal data revealing ethnic or racial origin and political or philosophical beliefs. The CICDR published various documents in order to bring to the attention of the media in particular and society in general writings by journalists which, because of their content, could have a negative effect on the image society formed of immigrants and ethnic minorities. In this regard, the CICDR drafted the following documents:

					Position on references to nationality, ethnic group, religion or legal status in news items from official sources and in the media, approved on 10 April 2006.

Position on references to nationality, ethnic group, religion or legal status in news items from official sources and in the media, approved on 10 April 2006.

Statement by the Standing Committee of the Commission for Equality and Combating Racial Discrimination (CICDR) regarding the article "Trade union claims rise in crime due to immigration" appearing in the Diário de Notícias, of 7 May 2006, approved on 8 May 2006, worded as follows:

[…]

-open letter from the high commissioner for immigration and intercultural dialogue, in her capacity as Chair of the CIDR, to the Portuguese media, released 17 September 2008, worded as follows

 […]

In general, the following initiatives have been taken with regard to promoting the rights of the Roma communities, their integration and the fight against discrimination:

1. Roma Communities Support Agency (GACI)(Gabinete de Apoio às Comunidades Ciganas)

[…] there are three main aspects to the Agency's approach: strengthening intercultural dialogue; promoting education and citizenship; and promoting Roma culture and identity embodied in its "Cigadania" programme. Implementation of this programme takes account of two main themes (i) intervention and empowerment and (ii) information.

1.1. Intervention and empowerment […] included support for the projects under the Escolhas programme and the empowerment of associations and their leaders […]

1.1.1. drafting and launch of the Guide to forming associations for the Roma communities, this guide is designed to help the Roma communities set up their own associations and improve the way they are run and the level of participation […].

1.1.2. Registration of Roma associations;

1.1.3. Training of leaders;

1.1.4. Drawing up the technical and financial support plan for Roma Associations;

					1.2. Information; 1.2.1. "Cigan-nos" site www.ciga-nos.; 1.2.2. ICE Journal no.9 "Roma and citizenship"; 1.2.3. The "Sintrenses ciganos" study; 1.3. The Enlargement of GACI Group; 1.4. Participation in activities initiated by other bodies".
	Opinion	Date of adoption : 5 November 2009; Date of publicati on: 26 April 2010	Advisory Committee on the FCNM; Second Opinion on Portugal; Adopted on 5 November 2009	National Minorities	"Despite some positive projects at the local level, many persons belonging to the Roma minority continue to be confronted with discrimination in various areas of daily life and to face, in some instances, hostile societal attitudes. Their situation in the field of housing is of particular concern as many Roma live in segregated areas, sometimes in substandard conditions. The situation of those Roma who are compelled to move from place to place is a source of deep concern. Roma also face difficulties in the education system and instances of placement of Roma pupils in separate classes, including in some cases in temporary prefabricated classrooms, have been reported. This is also a source of deep concern. In general, notwithstanding the efforts made in recent years, further steps should be taken to promote and expand intercultural education at school. Resolute measures should be taken to enhance consultation and co-operation between the authorities and Roma representatives and improve participation of the latter in decision-making, in particular on issues of concern to them. The authorities should publicize and disseminate information about the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities and the results of the monitoring process"
	Governme nt Comments	Date of receipt: 26 April 2010	Comments of the Government of Portugal on the Second opinion of the Advisory Committee on the	National Minorities	"It is important to state that the concept of national minority does not exist in the Portuguese Law. The Roma Community is recognized by Portugal as an ethnic minority. However, it is important to take note that this fact did not prevent Portugal to implement specific policies regarding the Roma communities, taking in account their specific traditions and cultural identity" "In general, all Roma communities have had Portuguese citizenship for centuries, and they are covered by the measures and have full access to the rights that are accessible to the general population (i.e. in the same conditions as the non Roma Citizens). Consequently, when they are in social situations of poverty and exclusion, the can have access to an important set of public programmes and measures. Among those measures are the Social Integration Income, housing programmes, measures for social protection and social

			Implementation of the FCNM		support for education, side by side with specific measures of positivie discrimination towards the social inclusion of the Roma communities such as the special integration measures established in the National Action Plan for Inclusion 2008-2010" "The project G9 was the inspiration model that led to the creation of the Pilot Project for Municipal Mediator (mentioned on paragraph 64 managed by the ACIDI"
	Resolution	Date of adoption : 15 June 2011	Resolution CM/ResCMN (2011)11 on the implementation of the FCNM by Portugal	National Minorities	"(…) in addition to the measures to be taken to implement the detailed recommendations contained in Sections I and II of the Advisory Committee's opinion, the authorities are invited to take the following initiatives to improve further the implementation of the Framework Convention: -initiate a discussion on the Framework Convention with persons potentially concerned by its application; - take resolute measures to improve the effectiveness and accessibility of domestic remedies against racial discrimination; - take further measures to improve the effectiveness and accessibility of domestic remedies against racial discrimination; - take further steps to raise awareness in society on discrimination-related issues and continue to address them in the training programs for officials of the judiciary and the law enforcement agencies; - take further steps to improve the housing of those Roma who live in substandard conditions; - identify and implement, as a matter of urgency, adequate solutions to the problems facing those Roma who are allegedly compelled to move from place to place; take measures to enable them to have access to stable residency and have equal access to rights and services; - continue to implement policies and programs to promote intercultural dialogue and tolerance, and to combat discrimination and racism; promote the role of socio-cultural mediators; - continue to take measures to improve the relations between the police and persons belonging to ethnic minorities, namely the Roma; investigate and sanction adequately all cases of alleged police misconduct in relation to persons belonging to ethnic minorities;

					- pursue and step up efforts to combat the dissemination of stereotypes and prejudices against person belonging to ethnic minorities in the media; - take further steps to develop intercultural teaching at school; promote the inclusion of information on Roma history, cultural heritage and language in school textbooks and improve teacher training in this respect; - continue to promote consultation of persons belonging to the Roma ethnic community, including by developing further mediation programs; take resolute measures to improve Roma participation in public affairs, in particular those of concern to them; take further positive measures to improve the employment situation of the Roma, with a view to increasing their participation in socio-economic life.
Third Cycle	State Report	due on 1 September 2013 3rd report received on 24 September 2013	3rd report due on 1 September 2013 3rd report received on 24 September 2013 https://rm.coe.int/168008b7c7	National Minorities	"The Portuguese Government launched the Portuguese Strategy for Inclusion of the Roma Communities 2013-2010 in 2013. This is an important instrument which will help Portugal to better integrate Roma Communities and to eliminate prejudices and misconceptions. The main areas of Strategy are_ education, health, housing and employment. The strategy addresses the recommendations of the European Commission and also includes the fight against discrimination, gender perspective, mediation, Roma History and Culture, and Justice and Security as crosscutting areas". The report recommends that Portugal: - "take resolute measures to improve the effectiveness and accessibility of domestic remedies against racial discrimination; take further steps to raise awareness in society on discrimination-related issues and continue to address them in the training programmes for officials of the judiciary and the law enforcement agencies"; - "take further steps to improve the housing of Roma who live in substandard conditions"; - Identify and implement, as a matter of urgency, adequate solutions to the problems facing those Roma who are allegedly compelled to move from place to place" - "take measures to enable them to have access to stable residency and have equal access to rights and services" - Continue to implement policies and programmes to promote intercultural dialogue and tolerance, and to combat discrimination and racism"; - Promote the role of socio-cultural mediators"; - Continue to take measures to improve relations between the police and persons belonging to ethnic minorities, namely the Roma;

					- Investigate and sanction adequately all cases of alleged police misconduct in relation to persons belonging to ethnic minorities - Pursue and step up efforts to combat dissemination of stereotypes and prejudices against persons belonging to ethnic minorities in the media - take further steps to develop intercultural teaching at school; promote the inclusion of information on Roma history, cultural heritage and language in school textbooks and improve teacher training in this respect - continue to promote consultation of persons belonging to the Roma ethnic community, including by developing mediation programmes: - take resolute measures to improve Roma participation in public affairs, in particular those of concern to them; take further positive measures to improve the employment situation of the Roma, with a view to increasing their participation in socio-economic life
	Opinion	Date of adoption : 4 December 2014 Date of publicati on: 12 June 2015	hird Opinion on Portugal https://rm.c oe.int/16803 04cdc	National Minorities	"Portugal continues to take a pragmatic, but limited, approach towards the implementation of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities. Projects to promote intercultural dialogue and to combat racial discrimination and racism have been maintained, and measures to facilitate the inclusion of migrants and integration of society have been implemented". "There is a general lack of awareness of the Framework Convention in Portugal, including among persons and groups potentially interested by the protection that it offers. No discussions have been organised concerning the possible application of the Framework Convention to groups other than Roma which could potentially benefit from its provisions. The opportunities for minority representatives and other non-governmental organisations to participate in the monitoring process are limited" "The antidiscrimination legislation and the corresponding system for domestic remedies need further improvements. The Portuguese authorities adopted in March 2013 the National Roma Communities Integration Strategy 2013-2020 and an Advisory Group for the Integration of the Roma Communities (CONCIG), coordinated by the High Commissioner for Immigration and Intercultural Dialogue, was set up in June 2014. However, problems persist as regards the concrete impact of existing legislation, the policies and practice on the issue of combating discrimination. Roma still face particular difficulties and discrimination in their access to employment, education, housing, health and social services".

| | | | | | "Roma also face difficulties in the education system and Roma pupils have continued to be placed in separate classes. Further steps should be taken to strengthen intercultural education at school, as well as to raise awareness among the general public about all the minority cultures as an integral part of Portuguese society".

"Some media continue to disseminate stereotypes and prejudices against minority groups, in particular Roma and migrants".

"Further measures should be taken to strengthen consultation and co-operation between the authorities and Roma representatives and to improve participation of the latter in decision making, in particular in areas affecting them.

 Issues for immediate action

- review the mechanisms for responding to complaints of racial discrimination, and in particular develop further positive measures to promote full and effective equality and significantly increase their impact;
- take resolute measures to put an end to discrimination against Roma in access to adequate education, housing, employment and health care facilities;

take vigorous measures to put an end to the practice of placing Roma pupils in separate classes; identify measures to prevent absenteeism and early dropout from school of Roma children, in particular among girls |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | Government comments | Date of receipt: 8 June 2015 | Comments of the government of Portugal on the third opinion of the advisory committee on the implementation of the framework convention | National Minorities | "Regarding the issues of concern mentioned in paragraph 101 of the Opinion, the High Commission for Migration (ACM) would like to reiterate that Portugal applies a comprehensive and integrated vision to equality rights and to the phenomenon of racism on the grounds of ethnicity, race and religious beliefs. The Portuguese approach follows an intercultural model based on integration as a two-way process through which the host society and/or the majority groups and the foreigners and/or the minority groups both have to accommodate and adapt themselves, whilst fully respecting and protecting all human rights and fundamental freedom"

"The National Roma Communities Integration Strategy (2013-2020) was adopted following an intensely participated process with the involvement of all Government departments, civil society organisations, academia, experts and representatives of Roma communities. It is an important instrument designed to further integrate the Roma population and to eliminate prejudices and misconceptions, thus contributing to the desired full realisation of the rights of the Roma population. In line with the European Commission's |

				for the protection of national minorities https://rm.coe.int/168030 4ff9		recommendation, Portugal designed its strategy around guiding principles and four strategic areas, namely education, employment, healthcare and housing. Portugal also added a crosscutting pillar in order to respond to several issues affecting Roma communities and to articulate all areas covering discrimination, mediation, education for citizenship, social security, valuation of Roma history and culture and gender equality" "A Consultative Group for the Integration of Roma Communities was created to monitor the implementation of the National Strategy and to assess the socioeconomic situation of Roma communities". "In closing, Portugal would like to reiterate that Roma communities in Portugal have been Portuguese nationals for generations. As such, members of the Roma Community benefit, without discrimination, from all of the measures in place for the general population, including social protection (e.g. Social Insertion Income, housing programmes and access to the National Health Service). "In order to promote the development of new projects, the High Commission for Migration launched a Fund to Support the Activities of National Roma Communities Integration Strategy (FAPE) in January 2015. Eleven projects were selected from all over the country. Those projects must be implemented during 2015, in partnership with different stakeholders, with a special focus on activities that promote the fight against discrimination, the information of the public opinion, training on citizenship and the promotion of the participation of the Roma in the community" "It is mentioned in paragraph 17 that 'expressions of racism and intolerance against Roma and migrants are common in the media and public discourse'. We consider that the Portuguese society has been able to continuing positively welcome and integrate immigrants. According to the 2011 Eurobarometer survey, only 3% of the surveyed Portuguese considered that immigration was an EU problem and 0% considered that it was a problem that Portugal was facing (compared to 20% and 12% respectively for UE27 average). This positive attitude towards immigration has also been very important in terms of public debate and legislative activity on immigration and integration. The New Immigration Act (2012) and the Nationality Law (2006) were approved by an overwhelming majority in the Portuguese Parliament, reaching consensus among the right and major left wing parties, and proved to be a step forward in welcoming and integrating immigrants. […]

					Finally, the consideration of the Advisory Committee that the alleged lack of consultation represents a 'paternalistic approach of the authorities towards Roma' referred in paragraph 37 does not demonstrate, in any terms, the commitment, the efforts and the permanent dialogue between the High Commission for Migration and the formal and informal representatives of the Roma communities.
	Resolution	Adopted on 11 May 2016	Resolution CM/ResCMN (2016)7on the implementation of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities by PortugaL https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=090000168064f4ea	National Minorities	"Although the legal and institutional framework for combatting discrimination has been established for a long time, shortcomings persist concerning the available domestic remedies. The complaints mechanisms, including recourse to litigation procedure, lack efficiency and it seems that there is a lack of awareness on the right to lodge complaints of discrimination. Also there is a lack of confidence as to the outcome of such procedures. Despite the programmes and projects developed and implemented over the last years, part of the Roma population continues to face discrimination in access to employment and housing and in the education system. Part of the Roma population continues to live in substandard housing conditions, generally in separated settlements, sometimes still surrounded by walls. Reportedly some Roma have been allegedly compelled to move from place to place, due to insufficient provision of stop-over facilities. Moreover, denial of access to public places and other manifestations of discrimination are regularly reported. No solution has yet been identified to promote sustainable alternatives to itinerant trade and selling at markets and fairs at local level. Schools are sometimes not sufficiently culturally sensitive to Roma children and a disproportionate number of them are purported to have cognitive and learning difficulties. Cases of Roma-only classes have been reported. There continues to be a lack of knowledge and awareness of the Roma culture, identity and history as part of Portuguese society. School textbooks in particular still lack adequate information in this respect. Some media, in spite of interventions of Media Regulatory Authority, continue to diffuse stereotypes about Roma" "Issues for immediate action:

					- review the mechanisms for responding to complaints of racial discrimination, and in particular develop further positive measures to promote full and effective equality and significantly increase their impact; - take resolute measures to put an end to discrimination against Roma in access to adequate education, housing, employment and health care facilities; - take vigorous measures to put an end to the practice of placing Roma pupils in separate classes; identify measures to prevent absenteeism and early dropout from school of Roma children, in particular among girls; Other recommendations: - continue to take steps, in close consultation with the Roma community, to review in school textbooks information on their history, cultural heritage and language with a view to eliminating any remaining stereotyped images of Roma in educational materials; raise public awareness about Roma being an integral part of Portuguese society; - continue to strengthen the mechanism of consultation of persons belonging to the Roma community, in particular in areas affecting them; - take more vigorous measures to meet the housing needs of Roma; examine the opportunity to increase the provision of halting sites, including by improving co-ordination of the different levels of authorities involved in site provision; - clarify the legal framework regulating itinerant trade at local level and also promote sustainable employment alternatives, in close co-operation with Roma representatives and based on their needs".

Programmes and strategies for Roma Communities

Type of document	Date	Title	Minority	Notes
Office	2007	In the context of ACIDI, it is created the GACI – Gabinete de Apoio às Comunidades Ciganas (Roma Community Supporting Office) http://www.portaldocidadao.pt/web/alto-comissariado-para-as-migracoes/gabinete-de-apoio-as-comunidades-ciganas-gaci		GACI mission is to strengthen intercultural dialogue, promote citizenship and give voice to Roma culture and identity.
Website	2007	Ciga-nos www.ciga-nos.pt		"the ACIDI launched the site www.ciga-nos.pt The site is accessible to the general public but is nonetheless intended more specifically for the Roma community, associations, technical staff, researchers and organizations working with the Roma communities, and is aimed at facilitating links between the various players and to promote and publicize their activities, especially those at local level undertaken by bodies working throughout the country. A further aim of the site is to help create a network which will come up with more effective ways of solving common problems, on the basis of projects involving Roma groups, especially those under the Escolhas programs. The site includes this database of projects and initiatives and is regularly updated. It also promotes recognition of the Roma communities and provides information material on the social and cultural dimensions of the Roma communities in Portugal." (ACFC/SR/II(2009)001
Strategy Law Programme	2013	Portuguese Strategy for Inclusion of Roma Communities 2013-2022 Law- Resolution nº25/2013		Newspapers inform that the strategy is about to change: "The National Strategy for the Inclusion of Roma Communities 2013-2022 is still in revision but the readjustment is in process. A new generation of programs it's coming and it is destined to open the labour market to Roma people, reveals the High Commissioner for Migration, Pedro CALADO". http://www.publico.pt/2018/01/30/sociedad

				e/noticia/vem-ai-umprograma-para-integrar-pessoas-ciganas-no-mercado-laboral-1800817 http://www.publico.pt/2017/08/02/local/noticia/governo-vai-rever-estrategia-para-a-integracao-das-comunidades-ciganas-1781155
	2013	Consultative Group for the Integration of Roma Communities (CONCIG)		"The Consultative Group for the Integration of Roma Communities (CONCIG) promotes the participation of Roma and the use of integrated approaches. It also contributes to a general mobilisation of partners (such as ministries' representatives, civil society organisations, experts and Roma communities' representatives) that work together towards a common objective. This Consultative Group has been a particularly active platform, namely by delivering statements issues and cases with a high impact on public opinion, for example on Roma girls' education or on cases of discrimination" (http://rm.coe.int/1680304ff9)

Programmes/laws/iniatives directed to minorities in general or anti-racists

Type of document	Date	Title	Minority	Notes
Law		Law nº105/2007, of 31 August Establish the legal statue of cultural mediator	Ethnic minorities	Establish the legal status of th[e] collaborative role in the integr[ation]
Law		The Law nº18/2004, 11 May (following the Racial Equality Directive 2000/43/EC		"Sets the framework for comb[ating] or ethnic origin, with a view to treatment" (http://rm.coe.int/

Programmes/laws/iniatives directed to vulnerable population that are used by Roma

Type of document	Date	Title	Minority	Notes
Programme		Programa Escolhas – Programme Choices (http://www.programaescolhas.pt) Normative Dispatch nº27/2009 – descendents of immigrants and ethnic minorities are considered the target audience of the program		"It is worth highlighting that more than 80 projects, targeting the Roma communities, are being implemented at this moment through the "Choices" Programme, which was developed by the High Commission for Migration. The Coice programme promotes the social inclusion of children and young people from vulnerable socio-economic contexts" (Comments of the government of Portugal on the third opinion of the advisory committee on the implementation of the framework convention for the protection of national minoritie (http://rm.coe.int/1680904ff9 =
Communitiy Iniative was financed by the	2000 - 2008	EQUAL[62]	Employabilit y and combating racism and	The iniative focused on supporting innovative transnational projects aimed at tackling discrimination and

---

[62] http://ec.europa.eu/employment_social/equal_consolidated/about/index.htm

European Social Fund (ESF) and co-funded by the EU Member States within the 2000-2006 programming period			xenophobia in the labour market	disadvantage in the labour market. These projects were created to generate and test new ideas with the aim of finding new ways of fighting all forms of discrimination and inequality within and beyond the labour market. This website provides an introduction to EQUAL and presents the results and the strategic lessons learned from the iniative under its five main pillars: increasing employability; encouraging incluisve entrepreneurship; facilitating adaptability;promoting gender equality and integrating asylum seekers
Law-Decree	1993	Defines the Special Plan for Relocation (PER)	People with housing needs	Many Roma families were relocated in social neighbourhoods
Law (Social security)	1996 - 2017	Integration Social Income

Law nº19-A/96, of 29 June

Law-Decree 196/97, of 31 July – I SERIE – regulates and create the guaranteed minimum income.

Law nº13/2003, of 21 May – Revoces the guaranteed minimum income and creates the Social Insertion Income

Lastest version of the law: DL nº90/2017, of 28 July | Vulnerable people (low income) | Introduces guaranteed minimum income, replaced in 2003 by the "Social Integration Income"

It is a cash benefit combined with a programme of social inclusion

Many times Roma people are accused of being "subsidy-dependent mainly because of the SII |